



## EXAMINATION OF CHANGES TO U.S. HISTORY AND GOVERNMENT-RELATED STANDARDS

By Rachel Canter and Toren Ballard

### Introduction

This document provides an analysis of changes to American history and government-related standards<sup>1</sup> within the Mississippi College- and Career-Readiness Standards for the Social Studies, 2021, as [filed](#) by the Mississippi Department of Education with the Secretary of State on December 16, 2021. The Mississippi College- and Career-Readiness Standards for the Social Studies is the document that Mississippi schools use to teach courses related to social studies. As explained in that document, parts of Mississippi and American history and government are required in social studies instruction in grades 4, 5, and 8 as well as a three courses in high school—Mississippi Studies (typically grade 9), U.S. History (typically grade 11), and U.S. Government (typically grade 12).<sup>2</sup> Additionally, Mississippi allows elective courses in high school that cover topics in American history and government; these courses are Problems in American Democracy, African American Studies, Law Related Education, and Minority Studies.

Because of the recent conversation about the teaching of “critical race theory” (CRT) in K-12 public schools, this analysis focuses on the standards for the most relevant and required courses—fifth grade social studies (U.S. History: Pre-Columbian Era to American Revolution), eighth grade social studies (U.S. History: Exploration to 1877), and the two required high school courses (U.S. History: 1877 to Present and U.S. Government).

### Overall Assessment of the 2021 Standards and Recommendation

We did find significant problems with the 2021 standards, but none of those problems relate to either CRT or “action civics.” In fact, **the 2021 standards do not introduce or require students to learn or apply CRT or action civics.**

Instead, what we found was a scandal of another type: **a profound inconsistency in the level of detailed content across the U.S. History and Government sequence results in students not learning major parts of American history at depth or at all.** Firstly, the purpose of the fifth grade course is very unclear. The course content substantially overlaps with the eighth grade course and somewhat overlaps with the high school government course and yet ends before the first U.S. presidential election. The fifth grade course could be better utilized as a full introductory course to U.S. history, with the eighth grade and high school courses offering more depth to build upon prior knowledge. **As it stands, Mississippi students do not learn the full scope of American history until right before they graduate high school; by the end of elementary school, they have not even learned about the presidency of George Washington, although they will have learned his role in the American Revolution.**

Secondly, the eighth grade course deserves the same attention to detail as the high school course. Too many deletions within the standards and objectives have rendered the course vague and reliant upon a district’s particular curriculum choice to

---

<sup>1</sup> Please see the section titled “Background on Standards for the Non-Educator” for an explanation of educational standards, as needed.

<sup>2</sup> Schools may also choose an optional sequence that places some American history instruction in grade 7, though this is less common.

determine what students learn. Although the fifth grade course is not particularly additive to the sequence, it is **the weakness of the eighth grade course covering the run up to the Civil War, the war itself, and Reconstruction that most concerns us**. Students in Mississippi are only provided one opportunity to learn this content and it comes at the end of middle school within a course that no longer even specifically mentions the Compromise of 1850 or the Emancipation Proclamation. This course must be revised if we want students to understand perhaps the most crucial event of American history since the Revolution and one that has the most profound reverberations for modern-day Mississippi.

Finally, although the high school courses are the strongest in the sequence, they too could use some improvement. The eleventh-grade U.S. history course needs some organizational work while the U.S. Government course needs some detail added back into its objectives. In summary, **we recommend that MDE not adopt the 2021 revisions without further work**.

### **Format of Analysis**

For each course we analyzed, we provide a brief description of the **purpose** of the course, an **overall evaluation** of the course and recommendation, a **summary of the most significant changes** to the course, and then an **in-depth analysis of changes** organized by standard.

We classify the substance of changes in three categories:

- **Formatting**: This classification indicates that the standard or objective has been re-formatted in some way but that this change is not truly substantive. We mark re-organizations—separating a standard or objective into two different standards or objectives, or reversing the order of objectives—as formatting changes. We also consider the deletion of the list of content strands at the end of each standard a formatting change.
- **Clarification**: This classification indicates that the standard’s meaning is now clearer to the reader, usually as the result of a rephrase or more precise word choice. Clarifications are minor substantive changes and do not radically alter the content contained in the standard or objective.
- **Content**: This classification indicates substantive changes to the scope or meaning of a standard or objective. Usually, these changes are major, but some content changes, such as the deletion of extraneous examples, may be minor if the deletion does not render the standard or objective vague or overly broad.

The summary of changes for each course is divided into 1) formatting changes and 2) clarification and content changes. The in-depth analysis of each standard (and their objectives) will label changes using these terms and then provide explanation and commentary about the strengths and weaknesses of the resulting 2021 standards or objectives. Where necessary, we suggest further changes or improvements.

Finally, we also provide the exact edits to each standard and their objectives using the following notations for additions, deletions, or amendments:

- Additions: Additions are marked with an underline.
- Deletions: Deletions are marked by striking through red text: ~~strikethrough~~.
- Amendments: Amendments which are not easily explained with an underline or strikethrough will be explained in parentheses: (*explanation*).

Please note that our notations do not align exactly to the notations in MDE’s filing because we found some errors in their document. We have also added some notations to make the changes clearer.

### **Background on Standards for the Non-Educator**

States create **standards** for every grade and subject to define what children should know and be able to do. Standards, though, are not the same as **curriculum**, which is the word educators use to describe the set of instructional materials, strategies, and lessons that a teacher may use to teach the standards. Standards and curriculum work together, but in Mississippi, as in many states, the state sets standards while local school districts choose curriculum to align to the standards. The Mississippi Department of Education does not currently have the authority to dictate exactly what curricula is taught in K-12 public schools in Mississippi, although they do make suggestions.

Mississippi's social studies standards are organized by grade from K-8 and then course in high school. Each grade/course contains standards as well as aligned **objectives**. Objectives are more detailed descriptions of what students should know and be able to do in order to meet a particular standard. Each standard typically has multiple objectives. Both standards and objectives are written as commands with a verb beginning the sentence to indicate not only what a student should know but how students should be able to demonstrate their knowledge (e.g., "Explain . . ." or "Analyze . . ."). The exact verbs chosen have importance to educators that may not be immediately obvious to non-educators without explanation. Here's a completely invented example: "Name the sixteenth U.S. President" requires a very different level of knowledge and skill than "Explain the significance of the sixteenth U.S. President to the development of American history." As in our example, verb choices in standards and objectives show the level of rigor expected.

One aspect of the social studies standards document that may be confusing to non-educators is that the document contains grades/courses which organize standards by "content strand." Content strands are disciplines within social studies. Mississippi's standards include five content strands: history, civics, civil rights, economics, and geography. When the standards are very basic—such as in grades K-3—they fit easily into a particular strand. Once students begin to learn about more complex topics, standards frequently span multiple strands, so it no longer makes sense to organize them this way. After grade 3, only the sixth grade course is organized by content strand. Since this analysis focuses on fifth grade, eighth grade, and high school, we do not describe the strand each standard covers.

## 5TH GRADE: U.S. HISTORY: PRE-COLUMBIAN ERA TO AMERICAN REVOLUTION

### Purpose of Course

This course is the required fifth grade history course. It is the first U.S. history course that Mississippi students take, although earlier grades may reference events or people in American history, especially in fourth grade Mississippi history. The fifth grade course covers the very beginning of American history, from just before European exploration to the writing of the U.S. Constitution. By the end of the course, students should know about the people who lived in what became the United States, at the dawn of the Columbian Era; early American settlements and the American colonial period; the American Revolution; and the creation of the U.S. Constitution. Several standards and objectives in this course are identical, nearly identical, or closely related to standards and objectives in eighth grade history. The U.S. Government course also contains standards and objectives which overlap with fifth grade content, but that course provides more depth on the workings and philosophical underpinnings of our government as opposed to simply its historical development.

There are six standards in this course, each named with “5” for the grade followed by a number for the standard. When referring to a particular standard, we list it by this name—5.1, for example. We refer to objectives by the standard name with an added number for the objective: 5.1.1. The 2021 fifth grade standards and objectives have been completely re-formatted since the 2018 version, as we explain below. As much as possible, we connect the two versions in order to aid the reader in understanding the changes.

### Overall Evaluation of Course and Recommendation

Looking at the 2021 fifth grade course in isolation, we find it much improved from the 2018 version. Nonetheless, the course does a poor job of explaining the origins of slavery in North America and the colonies as well as the reasons for the American Revolution. With only six standards, the objectives become even more important to filling in the content that should be taught; however, many of them lack depth. It is also confusing when exactly the course ends since the writing of the Constitution is referenced but not its ratification.

Our biggest critique, however, is the fact that the fifth grade course is the first American history course that Mississippi students take, and it ends before George Washington even takes office. Considering the fact that students do not take another American history course until the eighth grade (and that course ends with Reconstruction), **Mississippi students leave elementary school without a basic understanding of practically *any* American history and leave middle school with knowledge only of *half* of American history.** With the exception of some content on pre-Columbian Era North American and Caribbean Basin civilizations, most of the major content of the fifth grade course is repeated in the eighth grade course and again covered by some of the U.S. Government course. Why do Mississippi students learn the same content *three times spread over six years* but do not learn the full span of American history in a basic survey course even once? **We believe the fifth grade course should be entirely re-written to become a full introductory course on American history.**

A final note: **none of the standards or objectives in this revision introduce “critical race theory” to the course. Critical race theory is also not required by any standard or objective in this course.** Furthermore, none of the standards or objectives can be termed “action civics.”

### Summary of Formatting Changes

The format of the fifth grade course has changed substantially. Instead of being organized by “content strands,” the course is now organized topically and chronologically like the courses in eighth grade and high school. This organization aids in the



coherence of the course as the standards are now all clearly related and logically follow each other. Purely from an organizational perspective, the formatting changes are a vast improvement.

### Summary of Clarification and Content Changes

In addition to the extensive formatting changes, the content has also changed such that it is not easy to represent all of the changes with red line edits alone. The 2018 version featured skills-based standards as well as knowledge-based standards, but these were not explicitly connected. Some standards or objectives also featured events or details outside of the time period covered by the course or were so basic that they should have been covered much earlier than fifth grade. In this revision, some of the skills-exclusive standards have been combined with knowledge-based objectives to form new, more complex standards and objectives. This is a positive change as teaching these skills through content makes much more sense at this grade level. Several old standards no longer fit within the course once it was re-formatted and have been deleted, which also greatly improves course coherence. A list of the deleted standards and a brief discussion of them can be found at the end of this course analysis.

There are some helpful clarifications to objectives and a few additional objectives that provide more breadth or depth to the course. However, details have been deleted somewhat haphazardly throughout the document. Some of these deletions do not harm the clarity of their associated objectives, but many objectives need the examples or additional text to explain what students should know. This is a negative change to the course, especially when too many standards have too few objectives to begin with. Though the course is now far more coherent, its content remains vague, despite some helpful clarifications and additions.

### In-Depth Analysis

#### STANDARD 5.1

Standard	Objectives
<u>Investigate the people and ways of life of North America and the Caribbean Basin prior to the Columbian Era.</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(subsumes former G.5.1: <del>Locate on a map the physical features of America prior to Exploration.</del>)</li> <li>(subsumes former G.5.2: <del>Describe physical features of the environment.</del>)</li> <li>(subsumes former H.5.6: <del>Differentiate among pre-Columbian civilizations.</del>)</li> </ul>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><u>Identify the mountain ranges, rivers, and other bodies of water of North America and the Caribbean Basin.</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(subsumes former G.5.1: <del>Locate on a map the physical features of America prior to Exploration</del> and the objective G.5.1.1: <del>Identify major landforms and bodies of water</del>)</li> <li>(subsumes former G.5.2: <del>Describe the physical features of the environment</del> and the objective G.5.2.1: <del>Differentiate between landforms and bodies of water</del>)</li> </ul> </li> <li><u>Identify the major Native American tribes of North America and the Caribbean Basin at the beginning of the Columbian Era.</u> (former H.5.6.1: <del>Name and describe the different pre-Columbian civilizations.</del>)</li> <li><u>Map the territories of the major Native American Tribes of North America and the Caribbean Basin at the beginning of the Columbian Era.</u> (former G.5.1.2: <del>Locate on a map of North and South America pre-Columbian civilizations according to geography</del>)</li> <li><u>Determine how tribes in different regions used their environment to obtain food, clothing, and shelter.</u> (former G.5.2.2: <del>Identify how physical features impact communities</del>)</li> <li><u>Differentiate the lives and cultures of Native American tribes by region or territory.</u> (former H.5.6.2: <del>Compare and contrast the social systems of pre-Columbian civilizations.</del>)</li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Clarification and Content

This standard has been re-written to combine content from three previous standards (G.5.1, G.5.2, and H.5.6) and to re-focus the scope of the standard on North America and the Caribbean Basin (as opposed to nearly the entire Western Hemisphere). It is also a bit clearer in directing schools to teach about “people and ways of life” rather than simply to “differentiate among pre-Columbian civilizations.” The new standard, however, has somewhat awkward phrasing: “investigate the people and ways of life.” Better phrasing that is more consistent with the objectives would be something along the lines of “Identify and describe the tribes of North America and the Caribbean Basin and their ways of life prior to the Columbian Era.”

✓ Changes to Objectives: Clarification and Content

Because this standard combines three former standards, the new objectives are a combined and revised version of the former objectives. The new objectives re-focus instruction on North America and the Caribbean Basin, like the new standard. Furthermore, 2018 skills-exclusive objectives are logically connected to content in the new objectives. These are strong improvements.

**STANDARD 5.2**

Standard	Objectives
<del>H.5.2 Examine the reasons and impact for exploration of the New World.</del> <u>5.2 Analyze the motivations and consequences of the exploration and settlement of North America.</u>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><del>1. Locate and label on a world map the “Old World” and the “New World” along with</del> Map the European countries of Spain, Portugal, Great Britain <del>or England,</del> and France, <del>etc.</del> and their initial settlements in North America and Caribbean Basin. (addition from former H.5.2.4)</li> <li>Identify significant European explorers <del>and their routes to and through North America and the Caribbean Basin.</del> (similar to 8.1.1)</li> <li><del>Determine economic</del> Identify motivations for European exploration and settlement in <del>the Americas</del> North America.</li> <li><del>4. Locate and label on maps of North and South America land claimed by Spain, France, England, and Portugal.</del> (merged with 5.2.1)</li> <li><del>4. Explain the development and impact of</del> Give examples of items from the Columbian Exchange. (similar to 8.1.2)</li> <li><del>Analyze</del> Examine the relationship between early European settlers in North America and the Native Americans they encountered. (similar to 8.1.7)</li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Clarification and Content

This standard has been re-phrased to make it clearer and focused on North America rather than the entire Western Hemisphere. This focus aligns with the changes in 5.1. The standard also adds reference to “settlement” of North America (by European explorers) to broaden the scope of the standard beyond exploration. The additional qualifier of “by European explorers” would reduce the implication that no one had either “explored” or “settled” North America prior to the arrival of European explorers, and we believe it should be added. Furthermore, the standard should perhaps require students to “identify” motivations and consequences rather than “analyze” as that would better match the work of the objectives. If this edit is not made, the objectives should perhaps be re-written (see below).

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification, and Content

Most of the changes to the objectives are either formatting (combining related objectives) or slight clarifications (see 5.2.1,,3, and .5). However, 5.2.4 has been re-worded to make the task simpler—from “explain” to “give examples.” This is likely because the former, more difficult objective is now an eighth grade objective (8.1.2). While the 2021 objectives appear

appropriate for a fifth grade course, they do not quite fulfill the standard which calls for students to “analyze” motivations and consequences. Either the standard or the objectives should be re-written to ensure that it is clear what level of performance is expected of fifth graders.

Note: Three of the five objectives for this standard are closely related to objectives in the eighth grade history course. Although these objectives might not be taught at the same depth as the eighth grade objectives, this represents substantial content overlap.

### STANDARD 5.3

Standard	Objectives
<del>H.5.3</del> 5.3 Describe reasons for colonization of North America.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <u>Identify the economic, political, and religious reasons for founding the Thirteen Colonies and the role of indentured servitude and slavery in their settlement.</u> <i>(some content from former H.5.3.3; identical to 8.1.3)</i></li> <li>2. <del>1.</del> Identify the influential leaders and groups responsible for founding colonial settlements <i>(e.g., John Smith, Virginia; Roger Williams, Rhode Island; William Penn, Pennsylvania).</i></li> <li>3. <u>Compare and contrast colonial life in the Northeast, Mid-Atlantic, and Southeast regions of North America.</u> <i>(somewhat similar to 8.1.6)</i></li> <li>4. <u>Identify resources available to the colonists.</u></li> <li>5. <del>2.</del> Trace the development of democratic ideas and <del>discuss the structure of development of colonial representative governments that influenced the early colonies (e.g., Magna Carta, Mayflower Compact, representative government, town meetings, rule of law, legislative bodies).</del> <i>(similar to 8.1.5)</i></li> <li>6. <u>Contrast the views of land use and ownership by Native Americans and colonists.</u></li> <li><del>3.—</del> <u>Demonstrate an understanding of colonial economic life and labor systems in the Americas (Triangular Trade, indentured servitude, enslaved and free Africans).</u> <i>(partially merged into 5.3.1 and 5.3.3)</i></li> </ol>

#### ✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

This standard is identical to former H.5.3; only the numbering has changed. See below for a discussion of how the standard should be revised as a result of misalignment with the objectives.

#### ✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting and Content

The objectives for this standard suffer several problems and need extensive work. First, several of the new objectives do not seem to fit the scope of the standard. The standard itself is rather narrow—“reasons for colonization”—but the objectives cover everything from colonial life, ideas of land ownership, and the development of democratic ideas and colonial governments. Assuming that the content represented in the objectives is what the state intends for students to learn, the standard should be re-written to better explain what students should know about the American colonial period. In addition to aligning the standard with the objectives, 5.3.6 about contrasting views of land ownership should be moved to 5.2 as it is more related to content covered by 5.2.5 than anything in 5.3.

Another problem is that new 5.3.1 is identical to 8.1.3, where it also appears as a new objective. Either the fifth grade objective or the eighth grade objective should be re-written so that they build on each other rather than repeat. Two other objectives, though not identical, also substantially overlap with eighth grade objectives. Additionally, the language of new 5.3.4 is too vague—does it refer to economic resources? natural resources? human resources? all of the above?

Edits to 5.3.5 are a mixed bag. The second half of the new objective makes more sense now (what did “the structure of colonial governments that influenced the early colonies” mean? how is the Magna Carta or “rule of law” an example of a colonial government?), but the first half of the objective remains overly broad (“the development of democratic ideas”) and the second half is now somewhat vague due to the deletion of the clarifying text (what, precisely, should schools focus on in teaching the “development of colonial governments?”). (Clarifying text has also been removed from 5.3.2, but these deletions do not make the objective vague as there are a limited number of possible choices.)

Finally, content from former H.5.3.3 has been incorporated into two different objectives. However, new 5.3.3 now references colonial life in general and does not specify economic life (or slavery, specifically) which is important in learning the roots of how the North and South began to diverge, eventually leading to the Civil War. Furthermore, new 5.3.1 does not specifically mention the Triangular Trade, which is fundamental to understanding this time period. Reference to “the role of . . . slavery in [the] settlement [of the Thirteen Colonies]” does not cover the Middle Passage and potentially does not cover why slavery gained such a foothold in the American Southeast. These objectives should be strengthened.

#### STANDARD 5.4

Standard	Objectives
<del>H.5.5 Chart the causes and events leading to the American Revolution. Cite the reasons for the establishment of early colonies in North America.</del> 5.4 Trace the development of the revolutionary movement in North America.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><del>1. Explain the impact of</del> Examine the causes and consequences of the French and Indian War <del>on the American Revolution</del> (formerly H.5.5.1; nearly identical to 8.2.1)</li> <li><del>2. Describe the colonial reaction to the British Stamp Act, Intolerable Acts, Boston Massacre, and Tea Act.</del> Identify actions taken by the British and colonists and explain how each led to the Revolutionary War. (similar to 8.2.2)</li> </ol>

#### ✓ Changes to the Standard: Content

The revision to this standard focuses its scope on the development of the American Revolution and removes the duplicative reference to the establishment of the colonies, which is covered in standard 5.3. This is a positive change. However, the actual wording of the standard seems a little abstruse. A simpler phrasing—“Trace the development of the American Revolution”—would be better.<sup>3</sup>

#### ✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting and Content

There are only two objectives for this standard, which is insufficient for communicating what precipitated the American Revolution. Furthermore, both objectives are very broad, especially the second objective as revised, which implies specific actions of importance but lists none. Some of these key actions were in the previous objective but have been deleted. Finally, 5.4.1 is nearly identical to 8.2.1, with the only difference being the choice of one of two very similar verbs—“examine” versus “analyze.” We believe that these objectives are among the weakest in the course. The state should add more objectives and make each more specific.

<sup>3</sup> We do not particularly like the verb “trace” as used here but we kept it to show how changing very few words can make the standard more straightforward.

**STANDARD 5.5**

Standard	Objectives
<del>H.5.4</del> 5.5-Explain major events of the American Revolution and their outcomes.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <del>Outline</del> Analyze the principles <del>contained in</del> of the Declaration of Independence. (similar to USG.2.6; related to 8.2.5)</li> <li>2. Identify key battles of the American Revolution <del>and their outcomes (e.g., Lexington and Concord, Bunker Hill, Saratoga, Cowpens, and Yorktown).</del> (similar to 8.2.7)</li> <li>3. Describe the roles and contributions of: Thomas Jefferson, Samuel Adams, Paul Revere, Patrick Henry, Thomas Paine, George Washington, <del>and Haym Solomon [sic]<sup>4</sup>, and supporters from other countries to the American cause.</del> (similar to 8.2.3)</li> <li>4. Discuss the contributions of ordinary citizens, including African Americans and women, to the American Revolution.</li> <li>5. Examine efforts to mobilize support for the American Revolution by the Minutemen, Committees of Correspondence, First Continental Congress, Sons of Liberty, and the Second Continental Congress. (somewhat related to 8.2.4)</li> <li>6. <del>Cite reasons for</del> Explain the colonial victory <del>in</del> of the American Revolution.</li> <li>7. Summarize the effect of the Treaty of Paris of 1783 on the development of the United States. (similar to 8.2.8)</li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Content

The standard is nearly identical to its predecessor except that the words “and their outcomes” have been deleted. Although this does change the standard, the objectives remain largely the same. Furthermore, the words “and their outcomes” have been added to the objective about key battles. The effect is that this change is minor.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Clarification and Content

There are a handful of changes to the objectives. First, edits to the verbs in two objectives (5.5.1 and 5.5.6) have improved their rigor. The deletion of examples in 5.5.2 does not alter the meaning of the objective or make it too vague, so this is not a significant change. However, the deletion of the words “and supporters of other countries to the American cause” in 8.2.3 is a substantive content change. None of the other objectives discuss how other countries’ supporters—French or Prussian military leaders, for example—were important to helping the American cause. We think this is a negative change.

The bigger problem with these objectives is not the edits but what is missing. Unlike other objectives in this course, two contain lists of key figures or organizations. This is positive. However, the choice of details, particularly in 8.2.3, leaves a lot to be desired. Each of the men listed are certainly important, but the omission of any women or people of color—and their relegation to anonymous “ordinary citizens” in 5.5.4—leaves the impression that only white men were leaders during the Revolutionary period. Though it is true that only white men could hold office, go to college, or join the military, there are multiple examples of women and people of color who made significant contributions to the Revolution and should be remembered by name in a list like this. Similarly, 5.5.5 mentions the Sons of Liberty but not the Daughters of Liberty who also played a critical role in the road to revolution by leading boycotts of British goods. In all of these objectives, we recognize that not every person or organization may be listed as examples lest the standards become unwieldy. However, a full understanding of history requires that students know the breadth of people who contributed to significant events, especially in a diverse country.

<sup>4</sup> “Soloman” here is misspelled. It should be “Saloman.”

Finally, five of these seven objectives overlap with content covered in the eighth grade course or the high school government course.

### STANDARD 5.6

Standard	Objectives
<del>CI.5.1 Explain how weaknesses of the Articles of Confederation led to the Constitution.</del> <u>5.6 Examine the development of the Constitution of the United States.</u>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><del>List the problems</del> Analyze the shortcomings of the Articles of Confederation such as <del>lack of executive branch, no taxation power, and weak central government.</del> (formerly CI.5.1.1; similar to 8.3.2)</li> <li><del>Identify the contributions of</del> Explain how the Northwest Ordinance influenced framers of the Constitution. (formerly CI.5.1.2)</li> <li>Identify significant attendees of the Constitutional Convention.</li> <li><del>Identify</del> Contrast the ideology of Federalists <del>and from that of the Anti-Federalists</del> facts. (formerly CI.5.1.3; similar to 8.3.5)</li> <li>Describe the plans and compromises that contributed to the creation of the Constitution. (formerly CI.5.1.4)</li> <li><del>Explain</del> Evaluate the features of the Bill of Rights. (formerly CI.5.1.5)</li> <li><del>Contrast the rights held by the Constitution with the lives and treatment of African Americans, Native Americans, and women at the time.</del></li> </ol>

#### ✓ Changes to the Standard: Content

The standard has broadened beyond the Articles of Confederation to now encompass that topic as well as the actual Constitutional Convention. This is a helpful change as it aligns the standard to the objectives.

#### ✓ Changes to Objectives: Clarification and Content

The changes to the objectives generally improve their rigor and breadth. Several of the objectives (5.6.1, .2, .4, and .6) have new verbs that increase their rigor (“list” becomes “analyze,” etc.). Additional text in 5.6.2 helps clarify the purpose of the objective. Two new objectives—5.6.3 and 5.6.7—also further improve the standard by providing students more context. Finally, the deletion of explanatory text in 5.6.1 does not harm the objective, so this change is not significant.

As we state in the summary, it is odd how the course ends without a definitive final event such as the adoption of the draft Constitution on September 17, 1787, or the final ratification of the Constitution in 1788. We believe this is the most important weakness of these objectives and one of the biggest weaknesses of the course.

### Deleted Standards and Objectives

Below, we list the standards and objectives that have been removed from the course. Several of these standards are extremely basic (and have very basic objectives) and should be taught in lower grades (CI.5.2, CR.5.2, H.5.1, and H.5.2). Other standards or objectives reference features of the modern United States (geography, symbols, economy), practices with roots in 20th century America, or events spanning the entirety of the nation’s history, which is out of step with the time period of the course (CR.5.1, H.5.1.3 and .4). Finally, some objectives are so broad they could conceivably be taught through content in the 2021 course but were not explicitly connected (E.5.1.2, E.5.2). All in all, these omissions do not weaken the course, although they should be incorporated somewhere in the social studies framework, if they are not already.

Standard	Objectives
CI.5.2 Demonstrate respect for the rights of others in discussion and classroom debates.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Participate in negotiating and compromising in the resolution of differences and conflict.</li> </ol>

Standard	Objectives
E.5.1 Examine the various types of resources required to provide goods and services.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Identify the major resources of the U.S. to determine the major industries of those countries in relation to available resources.</li> <li>2. Examine why certain products are manufactured in particular places, taking into account the weight, transportation availability, costs, and markets.</li> </ol>
E.5.2 Explain how currency makes exchange easier by comparing a bartering economy to a currency-based economy.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Explore the characteristics of a traditional economy.</li> <li>2. Examine products that are imported into markets within the US based on demand for these products, noting [sic] how this affects the US economy.</li> <li>3. Distinguish products that are exported from the US to other markets in the Western Hemisphere, noting how this affects the US economy.</li> <li>4. Examine the meaning of unemployment, inflation, income, and economic growth in the economy.</li> </ol>
CR.5.1 Identify ways that people in roles of power can influence people's rights and freedom.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Examine at least one group of people, such as Native Americans, African Americans, women, or another cultural, ethnic, or racial minority in the Western Hemisphere, who have struggled for equality and civil rights.</li> </ol>
CR.5.2 Describe and explain traditions and contributions of various cultures.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Define culture.</li> <li>2. Recognize ways people celebrate their diverse cultural heritage (literature, language, games, songs, dances, holidays, etc.).</li> <li>3. Analyze ways people celebrate their diverse cultural heritage.</li> </ol>
H.5.1 Recognize symbols, customs, and celebrations representative of the United States.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Define symbols and customs.</li> <li>2. Identify school, community, state and national symbols (e.g., United States flag, American eagle, etc.).</li> <li>3. Compare and contrast the Pledge of Allegiance and other patriotic songs as expressions of patriotism.</li> <li>4. Explain historically significant events that shaped America.</li> </ol>
H.5.7 Describe the impact of significant historical figures and events.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Identify historical figures that are used as symbols of American culture (currency, monuments, and place names, etc.).</li> <li>2. Examine historical events that are significant to American culture (July 4th, Thanksgiving, Presidents Day, etc.).</li> </ol>

**8TH GRADE: U.S. HISTORY: EXPLORATION TO 1877****Purpose of Course**

This course is the required eighth grade history course. It is the first American history course that Mississippi students take that extends beyond the writing of the U.S. Constitution. It covers roughly half of American history, from European exploration to the end of Reconstruction. By the end of the course, students should understand the history of our nation's founding, its early years, and the crucial Civil War and Reconstruction periods. Some of the content about the nation's founding overlaps with both the fifth grade history course (U.S. History: Pre-Columbian Era to American Revolution) and the high school U.S. Government course. Several standards and objectives in this course are identical, nearly identical, or closely related to standards and objectives in fifth grade history, particularly in the period between 1607-1788. Though the U.S. Government course does overlap, that course provides more depth on the workings and philosophical underpinnings of our government as opposed to simply its historical development.

There are ten standards in this course, each named with "8" for the grade followed by a number for the standard. When referring to a particular standard, we list it by this name—8.1, for example. Objectives are referred to by the standard name with an added number for the objective: 8.1.1. At times, the 2021 standards or objectives have moved since the 2018 revision. In these cases, we specify whether the standard or objective refers to the current 2021 version or the former 2018 version.

**Overall Evaluation of Course and Recommendation**

Especially compared to the quality of its high school companion course, we believe the eighth grade course is very weak. **It suffers from key omissions either not addressed in the 2021 revisions or actually introduced with the revision** (see below for more explanation). The lack of detail in many of the objectives means that the overall course does not provide sufficient guidance on what content is important for students to learn. Particularly because this is the only course all Mississippi students take that covers the early nineteenth century, the Civil War, and Reconstruction, it is even more important that the standards document is specific and does not leave content decisions to a curriculum, which should be chosen to align to standards, not to complete them. **We recommend revising the standards document yet again to introduce or re-introduce detail.**

Finally, **none of the standards or objectives in this revision introduce "critical race theory" to the course. Critical race theory is also not required by any standard or objective in this course.** Furthermore, none of the standards or objectives can be termed "action civics."

**Summary of Formatting Changes**

The eighth grade history standards revision deletes the list of content strands covered by each standard. Since most standards in this course cover multiple content strands, the information was not useful. There are a few places where objectives have been re-ordered within their standard or have been broken into multiple objectives, but the 2021 formatting is essentially the same as the 2018 formatting. Where formatting changes do occur, they improve the user-friendliness of the document.

**Summary of Clarification and Content Changes**

The clarifications to standards and objectives in this course are mostly minor edits to make the standards and objectives clearer or more readable. A few clarifications do increase the rigor of the objectives (e.g., "summarize" becomes "evaluate" in 8.1.8). Overall, the clarifications improve the standards and objectives, although there are a few places where clarifying text has been altered or removed in ways that are unhelpful.



Conversely, **most of the content revisions are detrimental to the breadth and depth of the course.** The detrimental revisions are exclusively deletions. Several revisions remove specific examples, leaving it up to a school's curriculum to determine which examples may be used to teach the objective and what emphasis to place on those examples. Some of these deletions are unlikely to decrease a students' understanding of the topic either because the objective is relatively clear or straightforward or because different examples may be equally illustrative. However, the deletion of some examples will have a far larger effect because it removes the requirement that students learn important content. For example, all reference to the Emancipation Proclamation and the Gettysburg Address have been removed from an objective about important "government documents and actions" during the Civil War. Not only is the objective now so vague as to be meaningless, there is no longer a specific requirement anywhere in the course that students learn about these two important pieces of history. The deletion of examples also takes almost all of the content out of two standards—8.7, which is about social and political reform movements such as abolition and Women's Suffrage, and 8.10, which is about Reconstruction. The remaining objectives are not only too few to fully teach the scope of these standards as written but they are also too vague to provide direction to schools about what students should know.

In addition to the deletion of important examples, the whole-cloth deletion of a few objectives also removes important historical events from the course. The critical topics that are now entirely missing are as follows:

- Texas Independence and the Mexican-American War, which are important to understanding our country's geography as well as the path to the Civil War;
- The "works" of formerly enslaved African Americans who worked to lead others to freedom, which was the only objective specifically about the lives of formerly enslaved peoples;
- Important legislative and legal developments in the history of slavery leading to the Civil War, including such developments as the Missouri Compromise, the Compromise of 1850, the Kansas-Nebraska Act, and the Dred Scott Decision.

Considering that the objectives *already* omitted specific mention of events—the Monroe Doctrine, the history of tariffs, the expansion of voting rights in the first half of the nineteenth century, the history of immigration in the early American period, the history of rebellions of enslaved people, the re-alignment of early political parties, the California Gold Rush, the Election of 1860, the Great Sioux War of 1876, and the Election of 1876 and the Compromise of 1877, to name a few—the further erosion of topics within the standards is highly problematic. While not every event in American history can be covered in any (half) survey course, it is not at all clear reading the 2021 standards document that students will learn these and other important topics.

One of the few bright spots of the 2021 content revisions is that they add an objective about the Declaration of Independence, which had been strangely missing from the 2018 objectives.

#### STANDARD 8.1

Standard	Objectives
Examine major aspects of the development of the United States from Exploration to 1754. ( <del>Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics</del> )	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Trace explorers' routes to the New World. (<i>similar to 5.2.2</i>)</li> <li>2. <del>Give examples of items involved in the</del> Explain the development and impact of the Columbian Exchange. (<i>similar to 5.2.4</i>)</li> <li>3. <del>Identify the beginning of the Atlantic slave trade with Spaniards in South/Central America.</del> Identify the economic, political, and religious reasons for founding the Thirteen Colonies and the role of indentured servitude and slavery in their settlement. (<i>identical to 5.3.1</i>)</li> </ol>

Standard	Objectives
	<p>4. <del>5.</del> Describe how the English Bill of Rights, <del>The</del> Mayflower Compact, and <del>The</del> Virginia House of Burgesses led to the English Colonial idea of self-government. <del>Describe the social structures that formed in the various colonies.</del> (deletion moved to 8.1.6; similar to 5.3.5)</p> <p>5. <del>4.</del> Examine the diversity that emerged from the establishment of Colonial America. (formerly 8.1.4)</p> <p>6. <del>Describe the social structures that formed in the various colonies.</del> (moved from part of former 8.1.5)</p> <p>7. <del>6.</del> Describe the relationships between the various Native American and colonial groups. (similar to 5.2.5)</p>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The content strand information has been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification, and Content

The 2021 revision of these objectives includes three formatting changes: two objectives are re-ordered and one of those re-ordered objectives is also broken into two. There is also a substantive change to the wording of 8.1.2 which increases the rigor of the objective (“give examples” requires a lower level of critical thinking than “explain the development and impact”). The former, less rigorous objective is now a fifth grade objective.

The most important change relates to the content of 8.1.3. This objective is now re-focused on the founding of the original thirteen colonies and the role of indentured servitude and slavery as opposed to the Atlantic slave trade in Central and South America. This change better reflects the scope of the standard; however, this new objective is identical to a new fifth grade objective (5.3.1), which begs the question of whether this objective should be re-written to build upon previous knowledge. In total, five of the seven objectives overlap with fifth grade objectives.

Finally, new objective 8.1.6 is vague as written. Since it originally was connected to an objective about self-governance, does it refer to actual social relationships or forms of early governance? What is the significance of learning about social structures in this time period? The objective should specify.

## STANDARD 8.2

Standard	Objectives
Evaluate the key people, factors and events which led to the American Revolution and the establishment of the United States government. ( <del>Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics</del> )	<p>1. <del>Explain colonists' roles in</del> Analyze the causes and consequences of the French and Indian War. (similar to 5.4.1)</p> <p>2. Recognize and trace the major reasons for English taxes after the French and Indian War and colonial responses from 1763-1774 (<del>Proclamation of 1763, Sugar Act, Stamp Act, Townshend Acts, Boston Massacre, Tea Act, Boston Tea Party, Intolerable Acts, etc.</del>).</p> <p>3. Identify key figures in the Revolutionary Era (<del>George Washington, Samuel Adams, Crispus Attucks, John Adams, John Hancock, Mercy Otis Warren, etc.</del>) and their influence on the movement. (similar to 5.5.3)</p> <p>4. Compare and contrast the decisions <del>that</del> of the first <del>Continental Congress</del> and second Continental Congresses <del>made</del>.</p> <p>5. Explain the historical and present-day significance of the Declaration of Independence. (somewhat related to 5.5.1; similar to USG.2.6)</p> <p>6. <del>5.</del> Examine the immediate events that led to the first shot of the Revolutionary War <del>and the significance of major battles and places (Bunker Hill/Breeds Hill,</del></p>

Standard	Objectives
	<p><del>Long Island, Trenton/Princeton, Saratoga, Valley Forge, Monmouth, Cowpens, Yorktown, Morristown, etc.). (part of deletion moved to 8.1.7)</del></p> <p>7. <u>Examine the significance of the major battles in the Revolutionary War.</u> (formerly part of 8.1.5; similar to 5.5.2)</p> <p><del>8. Recognize key people's roles during the Revolutionary War (George Washington, Benedict Arnold, Horatio Gates, Nathanael Greene, Henry Knox, Charles Cornwallis, Abigail Adams, Mercy Otis Warren, Deborah Sampson, Loyalists, Patriots, etc.). (deleted entirely)</del></p> <p>8. <del>7. Summarize</del> <u>Evaluate</u> the terms of the Treaty of Paris, 1783. (similar to 5.5.7)</p>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The content strand information has been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Clarification and Content

Several objectives have been reworded to clarify what students should know or be able to do. Instead of explaining the colonists' roles in the French and Indian War, for example, 8.2.1 is now refocused on the broader causes and consequences of the war, which increases students' understanding of its importance to the development of the American Revolution. 8.1.8 also has its verb upgraded from "summarize" to "evaluate," which requires more critical thinking of students. The changes to 8.1.4 merely aid readability.

There are two important content revisions to these objectives. First, the revisions include a new objective focused on the Declaration of Independence. This addition should greatly improve students' understanding of the Revolutionary period as learning about this founding document did not easily fall into any of the other objectives. The second important content revision is that several of the objectives (8.2.2, 8.2.3, 8.2.6) have had their examples removed. Former objective 8.2.8, which was a more detailed version of 8.2.3, has been deleted entirely and its focus on the roles of key figures has been added to 8.2.3. These revisions increase the importance of the curriculum chosen by local school districts as the exact curriculum will dictate which political events, figures, and battles students learn. A minimum list of these items would be helpful here.

### STANDARD 8.3

Standard	Objectives
<p><del>Identify and evaluate the people, places, and documents that caused the founding of the nation and relate their significance to the</del> <u>Examine the development of the American Constitutional republic of the United States of America.</u> (Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, History) (identical to 5.6)</p>	<p>1. Describe the powers given to the Continental Congress by the Articles of Confederation. (similar to USG.2.5)</p> <p>2. Analyze the weaknesses of the Articles of Confederation that led to a call for a new constitution. (similar to 5.6.1)</p> <p>3. Identify the major compromises at the Constitutional Convention.</p> <p>4. Describe the framework of the United States Constitution, including powers of the Legislative, Executive, and Judicial branches. (similar to USG.2.9, USG.3.1)</p> <p><del>5. Describe the process of a bill becoming a law.</del></p> <p>5. <del>6.</del> Describe the compromises between Federalists and Anti-Federalists that led to the creation of the Bill of Rights. (similar to 5.6.4)</p>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting and Clarification

The entire standard has been reworded and simplified. We classify this as a clarification because the essence of the standard remains. The content strand information has also been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Content

Although the standard was entirely re-worded, the objectives are identical with the exception that former 8.3.5 has been deleted. The former objective was outside the scope of the standard which focuses on the development of the Constitution. Information about how a bill becomes a law is covered in U.S. Government, typically taught in grade 12.

**STANDARD 8.4**

Standard	Objectives
Analyze the challenges and central ideas involved in creating the new nation. <del>(Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics)</del>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Evaluate the differences in political opinions <del>of the new federal government</del> that led to the formation of political parties.</li> <li>2. <del>Distinguish the importance of</del> <u>Examine the lasting influence of</u> George Washington's <del>Presidency as the first President of the United States and his Farewell Address on the American Presidency.</del></li> <li>3. <u>Analyze the impact of President George Washington's Farewell Address on the presidency of the United States. (formerly part of 8.4.2)</u></li> <li>4. <del>3-</del> Analyze the significance of early Supreme Court cases and explain their impacts on the United States., <del>including:</del> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. <i>Marbury v. Madison (1803)</i></li> <li>b. <i>McCulloch v. Maryland (1819)</i></li> <li>c. <i>Dartmouth College v. Woodward (1819)</i></li> <li>d. <i>Worcester v. Georgia (1832)</i><sup>5</sup></li> </ol> </li> <li>5. <del>4-</del> Assess the <del>United States'</del> development and impact of <u>early</u> foreign policy decisions on the United States, <del>including: response to the French Revolution, Neutrality Proclamation, Alien and Sedition Acts, XYZ Affair, Embargo Act, impressment, War of 1812, Era of Good Feelings, etc.</del></li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The content strand information has been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification, and Content

Most of the revisions to these objectives improve their readability. The former 8.4.2 has been split into two objectives and each is more clearly worded. The one important content revision is that the examples have been removed from 8.4.5. Like other revisions of this type, the curriculum chosen by a local school district will determine which examples are taught to illustrate the objective. This is a negative change.

**STANDARD 8.5**

Standard	Objectives
Interpret the geographical, social, and political causes, challenges, and effects of westward expansion. <sup>6</sup> <del>(Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics)</del>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <del>Assess the reasons that the United States purchased Louisiana from France.</del> <u>Evaluate the reasoning behind the Louisiana Purchase.</u></li> <li>2. Discuss the <del>significant</del> significance of the Lewis and Clark Expedition.</li> </ol>

<sup>5</sup> There is a discrepancy in how MDE intends for this list to be represented when comparing page 62 of the 2021 standards versus page 235. We have chosen to represent them as an indented list, as this makes the most sense.

<sup>6</sup> There is a discrepancy in the order of words in this standard between page 63 of the 2021 document versus page 236. Because the 2018 standards list the order as "causes, challenges, and effects" we chose this construction.

Standard	Objectives
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><del>Analyze the</del> Describe the purpose, <del>and</del> challenges, <del>political, racial, religious and economic incentives associated with the concept</del> of Manifest Destiny. <i>(deletion moved to 8.5.4)</i></li> <li>Analyze the political, religious, and economic incentives of Manifest Destiny. <i>(formerly part of 8.5.3)</i></li> <li><del>4.</del> Summarize Andrew Jackson's roles in the growing United States, <del>including: Jacksonian Era, "Corrupt Bargain," Democratic Party, Bank War, Nullification Crisis, Indian Removal, etc.</del></li> <li><del>5.</del> Trace Indian Removal including the Cherokee's "Trail of Tears." Examine the motivations and consequences of the Indian Removal Act.</li> <li><del>6.</del> <del>Explain the causes and effects of Texas Independence and Mexican-American War.</del> <i>(deleted entirely)</i></li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The content strand information has been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification, and Content

Several of the revisions to these objectives improve their readability. Both 8.5.1 and 8.5.6 have been re-worded to clarify what students should know. The former 8.5.3 has been split into two objectives and each is more clearly worded.

There are two important content revisions. First, 8.5.5 has had its examples removed. As we have stated before, the curriculum chosen by a local district will determine which examples are used to teach this objective. We believe a list should be re-introduced. The other important content revision is that former 8.5.6 about Texas Independence and the Mexican-American War has been deleted entirely. This removes discussion of these concepts from the course, as no other standards or objectives cover these events. This omission will weaken students' understanding of a crucial part of American history that not only is important to the geography of our country but is important in understanding the events that led to the Civil War.

## STANDARD 8.6

Standard	Objectives
Interpret the causes, effects, and challenges of the Industrial Revolution. <i>(Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics)</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Summarize <del>how</del> <u>the beginning of</u> the Industrial Revolution <del>began</del> in the United States.</li> <li>Identify key people and their contributions to the Industrial Revolution.</li> <li>Trace the development of transportation and communication systems during the Industrial Revolution.</li> <li>Compare and contrast the cultural, religious, and social impact <del>in American life that resulted from</del> <u>of</u> the Industrial Revolution <del>on America</del>.</li> <li>Assess how geography influenced the location of factories, <del>including: rivers, urban areas, etc.</del></li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The content strand information has been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Clarification and Content

The changes to these objectives are primarily minor rephrases to make the objectives more readable. Objective 8.6.5 has had two examples removed, but we believe this is a minor change.

**STANDARD 8.7**

Standard	Objectives
Evaluate the impact of <del>the American</del> social and political reforms on the <del>developing</del> development of American society during the first half of the nineteenth century. (Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, History)	<del>1. Summarize the works of formerly enslaved African Americans who worked to lead others to freedom.</del> 1. <del>2.</del> Examine abolitionists' role in bringing the reality of slavery to the nation, including: Frederick Douglass, William Lloyd Garrison, Harriet Beecher Stowe, etc. 2. <del>3.</del> Compare and contrast the philosophies of natural rights expressed in the Declaration of Independence and the Declaration of Sentiments, including: phrases such as "all men are created equal, that they are endowed by their Creator with certain unalienable Rights." 3. <del>4.</del> Examine leaders of the Women's Suffrage Movement, including: biographies, writings, and speeches of Dorothea Dix, Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Lucretia Mott, Susan B. Anthony, and their influence on women's rights.

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting and Clarification

This standard has been rephrased, with some word edits to make the standard more readable and a clause deleted at the end specifying a time period. We consider this a clarification because the objectives cover events throughout the nineteenth century, not only in the first half. In particular, the Women's Suffrage Movement primarily took place in the mid- to late-nineteenth century. The content strand information has also been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Content

All of the changes to these objectives pertain to content. First, the original 8.7.1 has been entirely deleted. It is unclear if this objective referred to literary or art works or the actions and achievements of formerly enslaved people. Either way, with this removal, no other objectives specifically cover the lives of enslaved people in the United States, which will weaken students' understanding of slavery. Examples have also been removed from each of the remaining objectives.

Since there are so few objectives for this standard, the examples are particularly important in explaining not only the objectives but also the standard. What remains are very broad and vague objectives which are among the weakest in the course (are students supposed to learn about how abolitionists explained the reality of slavery or how they played a role in ending slavery? what does "examine the leaders" mean?). The particular curriculum chosen by a local school district will determine the scope and depth to which not only each of these objectives is covered but also the standard itself. More and better objectives should be added.

**STANDARD 8.8**

Standard	Objectives
<del>Interpret</del> Assess the social and economic conflicts between the North and South that <del>would eventually led</del> led to the American Civil War. (Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics)	<del>1. Synthesize prior knowledge of the geography of the Northern states and the Industrial Revolution to explain why slavery did not grow in the North. (related to new 8.8.2, with substantial edits)</del> 1. <del>2.</del> Trace the origins and development of slavery in the United States <del>and its impact on the nation's political, social, religious, economic and cultural development. (formerly 8.8.2; deletion moved to 8.8.5)</del> 2. Describe the impact of the Industrial Revolution in northern states. (related to former 8.8.1) 3. Evaluate the importance of agriculture in southern states. (part of former 8.8.3, with edits)

Standard	Objectives
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. <del>3.</del> Analyze the impact of the cotton gin on all social classes <del>and the importance of agriculture in Antebellum Mississippi.</del> (deletion moved to new 8.8.3)</li> <li>5. <del>Examine impact of slavery on the nation's political, social, religious, economic, and cultural development.</del> (part of former 8.8.2)</li> <li><del>4.—Identify major legislation and Supreme Court decisions that strived to both overturn and preserve slavery resulting in sectional strife, including: Missouri Compromise, Compromise of 1850, Fugitive Slave Act, Kansas Nebraska Act, Bleeding Kansas, Dred Scott Decision, Underground Railroad, Quakers' Influence, etc. (deleted entirely)</del></li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting and Clarification

The standard has been reworded for readability. The content strand information has been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification, and Content

There are substantial formatting edits to these objectives that separate previously complex objectives into multiple, simpler objectives. Some objectives have also been re-ordered and one has been broadened to focus on all southern states rather than just Mississippi (8.8.3). The rephrase of 8.8.2 (former 8.8.1) also re-centers the objective on the role of the Industrial Revolution in the economic development of the North (in contrast to 8.8.3 which focuses on the economic development of the South) while allowing 8.8.1 and 8.8.5 to fully examine the history and impact of slavery on the entire country.

The sole content revision is the deletion of former 8.8.4, which required students to understand important legislative and legal developments pertaining to slavery that occurred in the run up to the Civil War. Though these developments may be covered by 8.8.1, their omission risks students will not learn these events or learn them at depth, depending on the curriculum chosen by local school districts. We believe this weakens the course.

## STANDARD 8.9

Standard	Objectives
<del>Identify and evaluate the key events and people involved in</del> Identify key people and evaluate the significant events of the American Civil War. (Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Analyze the reasons <del>that the North and the South waged war against one another for the Civil War,</del> including slavery and states' rights.</li> <li>2. Examine key early battles and plans which shaped decisions for the North <del>and South, including: First Bull Run, Shiloh, Antietam, Vicksburg, Gettysburg, Sherman March, Anaconda Plan, etc.</del></li> <li>3. Identify <del>key Northern and Southern</del> significant political and military leaders <del>from the North and the South</del> and <del>examine</del> their contributions.</li> <li>4. Evaluate the contributions of women, African Americans, and other minority groups to the war effort, <del>including: Clara Barton, 54th Massachusetts Regiment, Native Americans.</del></li> <li>5. <del>Trace the events</del> Analyze the factors that led to the Northern victory <del>in</del> of the Civil War, <del>including: total war, industrial, population, resources, and technological advantages.</del></li> <li>6. Analyze key <del>government</del> documents and actions <del>(North and South) during of the Civil War, including: Emancipation Proclamation, Gettysburg Address, draft laws, income tax.</del></li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting and Clarification

The rephrase of this standard makes it easier to understand. The content strand information has also been deleted.



✓ Changes to Objectives: Clarification and Content

There are a few word edits to these objectives that make them more clear; these edits occur in objectives 8.9.1, 8.9.3, and 8.9.5.

There are a few important content changes. First, the deletion of the words “and South” in 8.9.2 seems an odd choice as the objective now solely focuses on how early battles affected the North alone, rather than both the North and South. We cannot be sure if this is an error, but it weakens the objective and students’ understanding of how the war unfolded. Word edits to 8.9.6 also do not improve it. The word “government” has been inserted to modify “documents and actions” but clarifying text that indicates both North and South should be analyzed has been removed. As the examples have also been deleted, the new objective is less clear as to its meaning. We also believe that the Emancipation Proclamation and Gettysburg Address are important enough that they warrant specific mention and removing them weakens students’ understanding of history. Finally, deletions have been made throughout the objectives, just as with 8.9.6. The curriculum selected by local school districts will determine which examples are used, a negative change.

**STANDARD 8.10**

Standard	Objectives
Analyze the Reconstruction efforts in <del>the</del> post-Civil War America United States. ( <del>Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics</del> )	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Compare congressional and presidential reconstruction plans.</li> <li>2. <del>4. Examine the</del> Analyze southern resistance to Reconstruction reforms, including: Black Codes, Jim Crow Laws, Ku Klux Klan, etc. (formerly 8.10.4, with edits)</li> <li>3. <del>2.</del> Trace the economic changes in the post-Civil War South, including: Lincoln’s Plan, Wade-Davis Bill, Johnson’s Plan, Radical Reconstruction.</li> <li>4. <del>3. Distinguish</del> Examine the roles of the Thirteenth, Fourteenth, and Fifteenth Amendments in expanding liberty for more Americans.</li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The standard had some minor word edits. The content strand information has also been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Clarification and Content

Two objectives have had their verbs altered (“examine” becomes “analyze” and “distinguish” becomes “examine”) and a few words have been added to 8.10.4. These minor edits make the objectives clearer.

The content changes are deletions to examples in 8.10.2 and 8.10.3. The examples in 8.10.3 (former 8.10.2) did not make sense, as these are related to congressional and presidential reconstruction plans covered by 8.10.1. However, there is no clarifying detail in the objective now to explain what schools should focus on. The deletions in 8.10.2 make the meaning of the objective less clear as the broad phrasing remaining does not give enough direction to schools about teaching the white Southern resistance immediately following the Civil War (Black Codes, the Ku Klux Klan), how Radical Reconstruction resulted from this resistance, and Redemption (extrajudicial violence and Jim Crow). As a whole, the objectives for this standard are among the weakest in the document. They do not adequately convey the events and importance of the post-Civil War period to the development of American history, particularly in the South. We believe more objectives are warranted here. Whether students learn enough about Reconstruction is almost entirely dependent on the curriculum chosen by their schools, and we believe this is a major problem. Finally, it is unclear how the course ends. The Compromise of 1877 is not mentioned, for example, and yet this event provides the entirety of the logic for why the eighth grade course is titled “. . .to 1877” and the high school course begins “1877 to . . .” Some details about this event and what caused it is imperative.



## U.S. HISTORY: 1877 TO PRESENT

### Purpose of Course

This course is typically taught to high school juniors and is a full-credit course. It is the final course in the U.S. history portion of the sequence and covers roughly half of American history, from the end of Reconstruction to the 21st century. By the end of the course, students are expected to understand the entire arc of American history, given that this course builds on content taught in previous American history courses in fifth grade and eighth grade. However, by the time most students are juniors, they will not have learned prior American history for at least two years; this substantial gap may hinder a comprehensive understanding of American history.

There are 12 standards in this course with each named as USH (for U.S. History) followed by a number. When referring to a particular standard, we list it by its official name: USH.1, for example. Objectives are referred to by the standard name with an added number for the objective: USG.1.1.

### Overall Evaluation of Course and Recommendation

Overall, this course is the strongest in the U.S. History sequence. **The breadth and depth of the explicit, detailed content makes this a superior course.** Nonetheless, the course could be improved with better attention to its organization as well as some strengthening of content connecting this course to its eighth grade predecessor.

First, the standards are sometimes organized thematically and sometimes organized by specific time periods. At times, this causes substantial overlap in content. USH.5, for example, is about “social and economic changes” in the 1920s and 30s while USH.6 is named “the Great Depression and the New Deal.” Several of the objectives directly overlap and could be either streamlined or better differentiated so that it is clear what students should know and duplication can be eliminated. Secondly, the placement of the thematic standards sometimes confuses the timeline of American history. USH.11 about the Civil Rights Movement, for example, comes in between a standard on Carter, Reagan, and H.W. Bush and a standard covering Bill Clinton to the present. It would make more sense for this standard to follow USH.8 about the rise of the Cold War and come before standards about domestic policy through Kennedy, Johnson, and Nixon. Some of the organizational issues are simpler to fix than others, but since the content of this course is so rich, it is a shame for organizational issues to confuse the substance.

In addition to the organizational issues, the course document could use some copyediting. There is awkward wording, strange capitalization, and other typographical errors that detract from the meaning and clarity of the standards and objectives. Fixing these errors would be simple and yet very helpful.

Our largest content quibble with this course is how it begins—the **first standard does not adequately connect this course to the eighth grade companion course.** Students should receive more information on major events in the South following Reconstruction (the impacts of Jim Crow, the rise of sharecropping, the worsening of poverty region-wide) and how sectional conflict evolved in this time period. As it stands, the course begins with a near-exclusive focus on the West with no mention of the aftermath of the Civil War (Manifest Destiny is namechecked but not the Civil War!) on social or economic relations in the late 19th century. This should be corrected.

A final note: **none of the standards or objectives in this revision introduce “critical race theory” to the course. Critical race theory is also not required by any standard or objective in this course.** Furthermore, none of the standards or objectives can be termed “action civics.”

### Summary of Formatting Changes

The U.S. History standards revision deletes the list of content strands covered by each standard. Each standard in this course covers all five content strands, which renders this information unnecessary. There are also some instances of objectives being re-organized; however, the formatting is largely the same as in the 2018 version and the minor formatting changes are not significant.

### Summary of Clarification and Content Changes

Most changes to the standards and objectives in this course involve either adding or removing specific content within existing objectives, though in some instances entirely new objectives were added. Many of the additions amount to substantive changes that will provide students a better understanding of American history. The additions cover the following topics:

- The 16th, 17th, 18th, and 19th Amendments to the Constitution
- Specific causes of United States' involvement in World War I as well as the domestic impact of World War I
- The Great Migration
- The contributions of Native Americans and African Americans in World War II
- Domestic social and cultural changes in post-World War II America, including the Baby Boom and G.I. Bill
- American foreign policy during the Cold War
- Non-violent demonstrations of the Civil Rights Movement

There are more additions than deletions. For the most part, the deletions are relatively minor compared to the additions. Here are some examples of deletions:

- The Professional Air Traffic Controllers Organization (PATCO) strike
- Invasions of Panama and Granada
- The Love Canal environmental disaster
- The Genocide Convention
- Demographic shifts such as international migration, the decline of family farms, and increases in out of wedlock births
- Marcus Garvey

### In-Depth Analysis

#### STANDARD USH.1

Standard	Objectives
<p><u>Westward Expansion and the New South</u></p> <p>Trace how economic developments and the westward movement impacted regional differences and democracy in the post Reconstruction era. <del>(Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics)</del></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Illustrate the impact of Manifest Destiny on the economic and technological development of the post-Civil War West, including: mining, the cattle industry, and the transcontinental railroad.</li> <li>2. Compare the changing role of the American farmer, including: establishment of the Granger movement, <del>and</del> the Populist Party, and agrarian rebellion over currency issues.</li> <li>3. Evaluate the Dawes Act for its effect on tribal identity, land ownership, and assimilation of American Indians.</li> <li>4. Explain the impact of the Populist movement on the role of the federal government in American <del>S</del>society[.]</li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting and Content

As in all standards throughout this course, the content strand information has been deleted. Additionally, the theme for this standard has been amended to include the words “and the New South,” but the actual standard language is unchanged. See below for why the standard and objectives need revision.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting

These objectives have the fewest changes of any in the course and are limited to the removal of colons, the addition of commas, and the capitalization of the word “Society.” However, considering that the standard theme now includes the “New South,” it would seem some new objectives are warranted to explain life in the South during this time period as well as the historical significance—and irony—of the term “New South.” Though the current objectives cover important post-Reconstruction events that also affected the South (Populism, in particular), they do not mention the most important events in the South in this time period—life with Jim Crow, the rise of sharecropping, and the declining value of cotton and tobacco leading to region-wide poverty. Especially because the end of the eighth grade history course is so vague, this course should ground students in how the country moved from Reconstruction into the Gilded Age (and what that term means). Furthermore, the standard requires that students learn how “economic developments and Westward expansion impacted regional differences.” Again, this is an opportunity to connect content back to the sectionalism of the Civil War. Although USH.1.2 mentions “currency issues,” we do not get a full objective on actual regional differences in the controversy over currency or anything else.

Of all the standards and objectives in this course, this standard and its objectives is the weakest. We believe the standard can be strengthened to clarify its scope and the objectives also expanded to match the full import of the standard.

**STANDARD USH.2**

Standard	Objectives
<p>Industrialization</p> <p>Analyze industrialization and its impact on the United States in the late 19th and early 20th century. (<del>Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics</del>)</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Interpret the impact of change from workshop to factory on workers' lives, including: The New Industrial Age from 1870 to 1900, <del>the American Federation of Labor of Labor Congress of Industrial Organizations (AFL-CIO)</del>, the Industrial Workers of the World (IWW), the Pullman Strike, the Haymarket Square Riot, and impact of John D. Rockefeller, Andrew Carnegie, Samuel Gompers, Eugene V. Debs, <del>A. Philip Randolph</del>, and Thomas Alva Edison.</li> <li>2. Compare population percentages, motives, and settlement patterns of immigrants from Asia, Europe, and including: Chinese Exclusion Act regarding immigration quotas.</li> <li>3. Interpret the impact of the New Industrial Age on life in urban areas, including: working and living conditions, the Labor Union movement, “New Immigrants,” Knights of Labor, American Federation of Labor, and the Industrial Workers of the World, the Pullman Strike and the Haymarket Square Riot, Samuel Gompers, Eugene V. Debs, Jane Addams and the Social Gospel.</li> <li>4. Analyze the effects of laissez-faire economics on business practices in the United States and their effects, including: John D. Rockefeller, Andrew Carnegie, JP Morgan, and Bessemer Process, horizontal and vertical integration, Sherman Anti-trust Act.</li> <li>5. Trace the evolution from the power of the political machines to Civil Service reform, including: Spoils/patronage system, Tweed Ring, Thomas Nast, and Pendleton Civil Service Act.</li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The content strand information has been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting and Content

In addition to a few minor typographical changes, there are two deletions of note. First, the revisions remove the American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations (AFL-CIO) from USH.2.1, though the American Federation of Labor remains included in USH.2.3. It is unclear why they made this change, as there is still significant overlap between USH.2.1 and USH.2.3. Both objectives concern themselves with the New Industrial Age and the lives of workers, with USH.2.1. focused on “the impact of change from workshop to factory” and USH.2.3 focused on “working and living conditions” in urban life. Since the content and examples are so similar, these two objectives should either be streamlined or clearly differentiated. There seem to be three distinct areas covered by the two objectives: the New Industrial Age (what it is, how it changed the way people work, and the role of the robber barons); the Labor Movement as a reaction to the New Industrial Age and its leading people and organizations; and the role of Social Gospel adherents (such as Jane Addams) in changing urban life. Because the mention of the Social Gospel seems tacked on and because it is a good way to connect the Gilded Age to the Progressive Movement, it should have its own objective. The other topics can be re-organized within the two existing objectives. USH.2.4 also has some overlap with USH.2.1 and USH.2.3 as well as USH.3.4, so the state should be careful to eliminate that duplication.

Finally, A. Philip Randolph is now excluded from the objectives for this standard, though he has been added to USH.7.9 (“Discuss the impact and challenges faced by women and minorities during the war . . .”). This choice downplays his substantial contributions as an early 20th century labor activist. It also narrows students’ understanding of the Labor Movement by removing reference to how African Americans were included or excluded from all aspects of economic life, including the jobs they could take and whether and how they participated in early labor organizing efforts. We believe he should be re-added to a refreshed objective on the Labor Movement.

**STANDARD USH.3**

Standard	Objectives
Progressive Movement  Evaluate causes, goals and outcomes of the Progressive Movement. ( <del>Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics</del> )	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Assess the impact of media on public opinion during the Progressive Movement, including <del>muckrakers</del> Upton Sinclair, Jacob <del>A.</del> Riis, and Ida <del>M.</del> Tarbell, <del>women's suffrage and Temperance Movement.</del></li> <li>2. Trace the development of political, social, and cultural movements and subsequent reforms, including <del>Jim Crow laws, Plessy vs. Ferguson,</del> women's suffrage, Temperance Movement, <del>Niagara movement,</del> public education, <del>Jim Crow Laws, Plessy v. Ferguson (1896),</del> Niagara Movement, the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP), and <del>Marcus Garvey</del> Ida B. Wells, Booker T. Washington, and W.E.B. DuBois.</li> <li>3. Compare and contrast presidential domestic policies, <del>including:</del> of Theodore Roosevelt, William Taft, and Woodrow Wilson; including <del>T</del>trustbusting, Pure Food and Drug Act, Meat Inspection Act, <del>Federal Reserve,</del> <del>C</del>conservation, the Hepburn Act, <del>Federal Reserve,</del> and the Federal Trade Commission.</li> <li>4. Trace national legislation <del>and constitutional amendments (16-19)</del> resulting from and affecting the Progressive Movement; <del>including:</del> the Sherman Antitrust Act and the Clayton Antitrust Act.</li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The content strand information has been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification, and Content

Most of the changes to these objectives are formatting to move the order or placement of examples (Jim Crow laws, Plessy v. Ferguson, and the Niagara Movement in USH.3.2; the Federal Reserve in USH.3.3) or make typographical edits. USH.3.1 has also added the term “muckraker” before the list of individual muckrakers, which clarifies the focus. The content changes are mostly positive. The deletion of women’s suffrage and Temperance in USH.3.1 help the objective make more sense, and the addition of constitutional amendments 16-19 in USH.3.4 is crucial to understanding the expanding role of the federal government during the Progressive Era.

The changes to remove Marcus Garvey from discussion of “political, social, and cultural movements and subsequent reforms.” Garvey’s exclusion may serve to streamline the list of prominent figures in USH.3.2, but his removal also removes any reference to Garveyism. In general, USH.3.2 is a bit of a kitchen-sink objective whose details are not very well organized. The content is all valuable, but it could be re-written or broken into multiple objectives to improve clarity and organization. Since some of the “reforms” resulting from these movements also overlap with the constitutional amendments listed in USH.3.4, some streamlining may be necessary.

**STANDARD USH.4**

Standard	Objectives
Imperialism and WWI  Assess the domestic and foreign developments that contributed to the emergence of the United States as a world power in the twentieth century. ( <del>Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics</del> )	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <del>Investigate</del> Assess causes of the Spanish-American War, including: yellow journalism, the sinking of the <del>Battleship</del> USS Maine, and economic interest in Cuba.</li> <li>2. <del>Evaluate</del> Explain the role of the Rough Riders on the iconic status of President Theodore Roosevelt.</li> <li>3. Analyze consequences of the Spanish-American War; including: <del>The Treaty of Paris of 1898, insurgency in the Philippines, and</del> territorial expansion in the Pacific and the Caribbean (<u>Treaty of Paris 1898</u>), <u>insurgency in the Philippines, and the establishment of the Anti-Imperialist League.</u></li> <li>4. Trace the involvement of the United States in the Hawaiian Islands for economic and imperialistic interests.</li> <li>5. Evaluate the role of the Open-Door <del>p</del>Policy and the Roosevelt Corollary on America’s expanded economic and geographic interests.</li> <li>6. Compare the executive leadership represented by <del>William Howard Taft’s Dollar Diplomacy,</del> Theodore Roosevelt’s Big Stick Diplomacy, <u>William Howard Taft’s Dollar Diplomacy,</u> and Woodrow Wilson’s Moral Diplomacy.</li> <li>7. Evaluate the factors that led to US involvement in World War I <u>including the Lusitania, Zimmerman Telegram, and unrestricted submarine warfare.</u></li> <li>8. Investigate controversies over the Treaty of Versailles of 1919, Woodrow Wilson’s Fourteen points, and the League of Nations.</li> <li>9. <u>Evaluate the domestic impact of World War I, including the war mobilization effort, changes in the workforce, the origins of the Great Migration, Schenck v. United States (1919).</u></li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The content strand information has been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification and Content

There are a number of changes to objectives for this standard. Substantive content changes include the addition of USH.4.9, which focuses on the domestic impact of World War I. “Establishment of the Anti-Imperialist League” has been added to USH.4.3, as has the Lusitania and Zimmerman Telegram to USH.4.7. Specifying the inclusion of these historical events and concepts serve to give students a more well-rounded understanding of this standard. The addition of USH.4.9, in particular, is a positive addition.

There are also two changes that adjust what students should be able to do with particular information: “assess” rather than “investigate” causes of the Spanish-American War, and “explain” rather than “evaluate” the role of the Rough Riders on the iconic status of President Theodore Roosevelt. These verbs are clearer, and USH.4.1 and USH.4.2 now make more sense. There are also minor formatting changes related to re-ordering the content listed in objectives for this standard.

**STANDARD USH.5**

Standard	Objectives
<p>1920s – 1930s</p> <p><del>Debate</del> Evaluate the impact of social <u>and economic</u> changes and the conflict between traditionalism and modernism in the 1920s <u>through the 1930s</u>. (Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics)</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <del>Debate</del> Analyze the impact of radio, cinema, and print media <del>for their impact</del> on the creation of mass culture.</li> <li>2. Analyze works of major American artists and writers, including: F. Scott Fitzgerald, Ernest Hemingway, <u>Langston Hughes</u>, and H.L. Mecken [sic]<sup>7</sup>, to characterize the era of the 1920s.</li> <li>3. Determine the relationship between technological innovations and the creation of increased leisure time.</li> <li>4. Assess effects of overproduction, stock market speculation, and restrictive monetary policies on the pending economic crisis.</li> <li>5. Compare and contrast the impact of the Smoot-Hawley Tariff Act on the global economy and the resulting worldwide depression.</li> <li>6. Analyze the impact of the changes in the 1920s on the economy, society, and culture, including: mass production, the role of credit, the effect of radio in creating a mass culture, and the cultural changes exemplified by the <u>Great Migration and the Harlem Renaissance</u>.</li> <li>7. Debate the causes and effects of the social change and conflict between traditional and modern culture that took place during the 1920s, including: the role of women, the Red Scare, immigration quotas, Prohibition, and the Scopes trial.</li> <li>8. Examine notable authors of the 1920s, including: John Steinbeck, William Faulkner, <del>and</del> Zora Neale Hurston, <u>and Langston Hughes</u>.</li> <li>9. Analyze the Great Depression for its impact on the American family, including: <u>the Bonus Army</u>, Hoovervilles, Dust Bowl, <u>and Dorothea Lange</u>.</li> <li>10. Investigate conditions created by the Dust Bowl for their impact on migration patterns during the Great Depression.</li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting and Content

There are a few changes to note with this standard, with mixed results. First, the time period now includes the 1930s as well as the 1920s, both in the theme and the actual standard. This better aligns to a few of the objectives, which cover content from the 1930s. The edits also add “economic changes” along with “social changes.” However, these changes deepen the overlap between this standard and USH.6. Rather than including the 1930s and economic issues here, the state should shift these

<sup>7</sup> “Mecken” is misspelled. It should be “Mencken.”

related objectives to the next standard to eliminate overlap and re-scope the standard to focus on cultural changes of the 1920s.

The other two changes are positive. The verb change from “debate” to “evaluate” better aligns to most objectives and makes more pedagogical sense for teachers. The content strand information has also been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting and Content

There are a few basic typographical changes (the removal of colons), but for the most part, the formatting of these objectives is unchanged from 2018. One major substantive change is the inclusion of the Great Migration in USH.5.6. This is a welcome addition and important context for students in Mississippi. In USH.5.1, “debate” has been changed to “analyze,” and the sentence structure has been modified somewhat. Not only does “analyze” as a verb lend itself better for pedagogical purposes in this instance, but the previous wording of the objective made little sense.

The strangest change is that Langston Hughes has been moved from USH.5.2 to USH.5.8, but there is no clear rationale for doing so (did his work not also provide social commentary?). Since these two objectives are so similar, they should either be streamlined into a single objective focused on notable literary figures of the 1920s or further differentiated as it is difficult to assess why particular authors appear in one place versus the other. There is also substantial overlap between USH.5.1 and USH.5.6 that should be addressed. Finally, objectives about economic changes and the Great Depression should be moved to USH.6 to eliminate overlap, as we state above.

**STANDARD USH.6**

Standard	Objectives
Great Depression <del>and</del> New Deal  Analyze the causes and effects of the Great Depression and New Deal. ( <del>Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics</del> )	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Compare the causes of the Great Depression, including: the uneven distribution of wealth; rampant stock market speculation; the collapse of the farm economy; policies of the federal government and the Federal Reserve System; overproduction of industry; and the impact of the Smoot-Hawley Tariff Act.</li> <li>2. Investigate <del>how</del> President Hoover’s initial conservative response to the Great Depression <del>failed</del> including the Reconstruction Finance Corporation, the Bonus Army, rugged individualism, and trickle-down economics.</li> <li>3. Analyze President Franklin Roosevelt’s New Deal as a response to the economic crisis of the Great Depression, including: Keynesian economics and the effectiveness of New Deal programs in relieving suffering, achieving economic recovery, <del>and</del> promoting organized labor, <del>and incorporating reforms</del>.</li> <li>4. Evaluate the impact of Franklin D. Roosevelt’s <del>on the</del> presidency <del>and the New Deal’s impact</del> on the expansion of federal powers.</li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The content strand information has been deleted and a slight typographical change has been made to the theme.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Clarification, Formatting, and Content

The most substantive change to the objectives for this standard include content for USH.6.2: the Reconstruction Finance Corporation, the Bonus Army, “rugged individualism,” and “trickle-down economics” have all been included. The wording of USH.6.2 has also been altered to remove the characterization that President Hoover’s initial conservative response to the Great



Depression “failed.” The success of his response is now up for interpretation. These are substantive changes, as is the inclusion of Keynesian economics and “incorporating reforms” in USH.6.3.

One minor clarification includes the re-wording of USH.6.4 to center Franklin Delano Roosevelt’s (FDR’s) presidency as the driving force behind the expansion of federal powers, rather than FDR personally or the New Deal specifically. This may serve to re-frame this objective somewhat, but the content is not meaningfully altered. Other minor formatting changes are negligible.

To reiterate a previous point, some of the content for these objectives overlaps with content in USH.5. We believe the related objectives should be moved here and streamlined as necessary.

#### STANDARD USH.7

Standard	Objectives
<p>WWII <del>at home</del></p> <p>Examine the nation’s role in World War II and the impacts on domestic <u>and international</u> affairs. (<del>Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics</del>)</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Explain the isolationist debate as it evolved from the 1920s to the bombing of Pearl Harbor and the subsequent change in United States’ foreign policy.</li> <li>2. Examine roles of significant World War II leaders, including: Franklin D. Roosevelt, Harry S. Truman, Dwight D. Eisenhower, <u>Douglas McArthur</u>, and George S. Patton.</li> <li>3. Describe military strategies of World War II, including: blitzkrieg, island-hopping, and amphibious landings.</li> <li>4. Analyze <u>the U.S. response to</u> war crimes committed during World War II, including: The Holocaust, the Bataan Death March, the Nuremberg Trials, <del>including: and</del> the post-war Universal Declaration of Human Rights, <del>and the Genocide Convention.</del></li> <li>5. Analyze the reasons for and results of dropping atomic bombs on Japan.</li> <li>6. Describe the mobilization of various industries to meet war needs.</li> <li>7. Explain <u>the expansion of</u> <del>how the US expanded</del> the US military through the <u>use of</u> selective service <u>and the contributions of Native Americans and African Americans.</u></li> <li>8. Trace the way in which the US government took control of the economy through rationing, price controls, limitations on labor unions, <u>Executive Order 8802</u>, the sale of bonds and wage controls.</li> <li>9. <del>Identify ways in which the roles of</del> Discuss the impact and challenges faced by women and minorities <del>changed</del> during the war <u>including A. Phillip Randolph, Bracero Program, the Zoot Suit Riots, Double V Campaign, and Rosie the Riveter.</u></li> <li>10. Summarize the discrimination <del>the</del> <u>that</u> Japanese Americans faced during WWII <u>including internment and</u> <del>Include the</del> <u>Korematsu v. United States (1944)</u> <del>US supreme court case.</del></li> </ol>

#### ✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting and Clarification

There are two minor changes to this standard that clarify the importance of international affairs in the study of World War II. “At home” has been removed from the title of the standard, and the standard has also been changed to include the nation’s impact on “international affairs” in addition to domestic affairs. These changes better align the standard to the objectives, as the study of World War II necessarily involves an international focus. The content strand information has also been deleted.

#### ✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification, and Content

There are several substantive content changes to the objectives of this standard. Specific individuals and events have been added to USH.7.2, USH.7.7, USH.7.8, and USH.7.9. Revisions to USH.7.7 and USH.7.9 are notable for including a greater



emphasis on the experience of racial minorities during World War II. One notable exclusion among changes to the objectives include the removal of the Genocide Convention in discussing the response to war crimes.

There are also some key clarifications: USH.7.9 has been revised to specify that students should “discuss the impact and challenges faced women and minorities” rather than “identify ways in which” their roles changed during the war. Additionally, USH.7.10 has been clarified to specifically include “internment” in discussions of discrimination faced by Japanese Americans. These changes better specify subject matter for students. There are also several formatting changes that are not substantive.

### STANDARD USH.8

Standard	Objectives
<p>Post WWII to <u>the</u> 1960s</p> <p>Assess <u>the evolving role of the U.S. in global affairs and changes in the United States including</u> the domestic impact on national security, individual freedoms, and changing culture. (Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics)</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Distinguish between cold war and <del>a</del> conventional war.</li> <li>2. Locate areas of conflict during the Cold War from 1945 to 1960, including East and West Germany, Hungary, Poland, Cuba, Korea, and China.</li> <li>3. Analyze the breakdown of relations between the US and USSR after WWII.</li> <li>4. Identify and explain the steps the US took to contain communism during the Truman and Eisenhower administration.</li> <li>5. Describe how the Truman doctrine and the Marshall plan deepened the tensions between the US and USSR.</li> <li>6. Identify the importance of the following on cold war tensions, <u>including</u>: Berlin Blockade, Berlin Airlift, NATO, Warsaw Pact, and Iron Curtain.</li> <li>7. Evaluate the role, function, and purpose of the United Nations (UN).</li> <li>8. Examine United States' reaction to Communist takeover in China.</li> <li>9. Summarize the Korean War and its impact on the Cold War.</li> <li>10. Describe US government efforts to control the spread of communism within the United States and <del>its</del> <u>impact of the Red Scare</u> on individual freedoms.</li> <li>11. Discuss the role of the space race <u>and the arms race</u> in the <del>Cold War</del>, taking into account Sputnik, the U-2 incident, and NASA.</li> <li>12. <u>Explain the social and cultural changes in post war America including the G.I. Bill, Interstate Highway Act, the Baby Boom, and the impact of television.</u></li> </ol>

#### ✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting and Content

The standard has been changed to center “the evolving role of the U.S. in global affairs” in addition to domestic impacts, which better aligns to the objectives which include several about international events. The content strand information has also been deleted.

#### ✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting and Content

The most substantive change to the objectives is the addition of USH.8.12, which examines “social and cultural changes in post-war America.” This is a logical addition among objectives that are primarily focused on the international sphere. Other content additions include the Red Scare in USH.8.10 and the arms race in USH.8.11. There are some additional formatting changes that are inconsequential.

### STANDARD USH.9

Standard	Objectives
Kennedy, Johnson, Nixon	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Analyze the domestic <del>policies and</del> events <del>during the presidencies</del> of Presidents Kennedy, Johnson, and Nixon, including: The New Frontier, Great Society, “the</li> </ol>

Standard	Objectives
<p>Demonstrate an understanding of domestic and international issues <u>from</u> each administration. (<del>Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics</del>)</p>	<p>silent majority,” the anti-war and counter-cultural movements, the Watergate scandal, including the Supreme Court case, U.S. v. Nixon.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2. Debate the reasons for the nation’s changing immigration policy, with emphasis on how the Immigration Act of 1965 and successor acts have transformed American society.</li> <li>3. Cite and analyze the impact of other minority groups to those of the Civil Rights Movement led predominantly by African Americans, including: AIM, UFW, and the Disability Rights Movement <del>American Disabilities Act</del>.</li> <li>4. Describe the changing roles of women in society as reflected in the entry of more women into the labor force and the changing family structure, including Equal Pay Act and the modern women’s movement.</li> <li>5. Analyze the impact of the environmental movement and the development of environmental protection laws.</li> <li>6. Explain how the federal, state, and local governments have responded to demographic and social changes, including: population shifts to the suburbs, racial concentrations in the cities, Rustbelt-to-Sunbelt migration, <del>international migration, decline of family farms, increases in out of wedlock births,</del> and drug abuse.</li> <li>7. <u>Analyze the international policies and actions taken as a response to the Cold War including U.S. involvement in Cuba and the escalation of the war in Vietnam as a result of the Gulf of Tonkin Resolution.</u></li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The content strand information has been deleted and the wording of the standard has been adjusted to fix a previous grammatical error.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification, and Content

The most substantive change to the objectives for this standard is the addition of USH.9.7, which adds a foreign policy focus—including mention of the Vietnam War, which was oddly absent from the previous standards—to a standard which is otherwise focused primarily on domestic policies. This is a logical addition that acknowledges the continuation of the Cold War through the second half of the 20th century. There are other content revisions, namely including the Disability Rights Movement in USH.9.3 and the modern women’s movement in USH.9.4. These are substantive additions, as is the exclusion of “international migration, decline of family farms, and increases in out of wedlock births” from the discussion of demographic and social changes. International migration is a curious exclusion from this objective, as much of the other content matter concerns itself with population shifts. USH.9.1 has been re-worded somewhat to clarify its focus, but this is not a substantive change. Some awkward phrases reduce clarity in these objectives and should be addressed.

**STANDARD USH.10**

Standard	Objectives
<u>Carter, Reagan, and H.W. Bush</u>  Explain the reaction to Carter's Administration and the emergence of the Conservative movement and its impact on domestic and international issues from 1974_ to 1992. (Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <del>Appraise the influence of</del> Evaluate the conservative movement as a response to <del>on</del> social, economic and environmental issues from 1974 to 1992, including: Moral Majority, Roe vs. Wade, <u>Regents of the University of California v. Bakke (1978)</u> <del>Case, Love Canal</del>, Three Mile Island, and Reaganomics, <del>PACTO, etc.</del></li> <li>2. Analyze Reagan's and Bush's <del>pro-active</del> international policies, including: <u>the Strategic Defense Initiative, Reagan Doctrine, Invasion of Granada</u>, Iran-Contra, SDI, End of the Cold War, <del>Invasion of Panama</del>, and Persian Gulf War.</li> <li>3. <u>Analyze the response of the Carter administration to environmental issues, the Cold War, and conflicts in the Middle East.</u></li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

A title has been added to this standard to specify that the standard should include content covering Presidents Carter, Reagan, and H.W. Bush. Its addition also aligns the formatting of the standard to the rest. The content strand information has been deleted.

Because the standard focuses on the rise of the conservative movement, it appears to give short shrift to the economic changes occurring domestically in this time period. Though some of this may be mentioned through USH.10.1, the current phrasing of the standard directs instruction mostly to the aftermath of the Carter administration. It also omits any mention of Gerald Ford from the course. The standard and its title should be clarified or broadened to ensure it is comprehensive.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Content, Clarification, and Formatting

There are a number of changes to the objectives for this standard. The most substantive is the addition of USH.10.3, which focuses on President Carter's term in office. Revisions to USH.10.1 ask students to evaluate the conservative movement as a response to "social, economic, and environmental" issues rather than appraising the influence of the conservative movement on these issues; this change will likely result in a substantive re-framing of the subject. References to Love Canal and PATCO have been removed from USH.10.1. Revisions to USH.10.2 streamline discussions of Reagan's and Bush's foreign policies by excluding the invasions of Granada and Panama. It is unclear why references to two of the chief military missions of these presidencies have been removed from analysis of their foreign policy.

As we state in our discussion of the standard, the objectives should be expanded to provide more explanation of the Ford and Carter years leading up to the Reagan Revolution. This will provide important context for students that is now vaguely alluded to in USH.10.1.

**STANDARD USH.11**

Standard	Objectives
Civil Rights Movement  Evaluate the impact of the Civil Rights Movement on social and political change in the United States. (Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Explain the importance of President Truman's order to integrate the U.S. military and the federal government.</li> <li>2. Trace the federal government's involvement in the modern Civil Rights Movement, including: the abolition of the poll tax, the nationalization of state militias, Brown <del>versus</del> vs. Board of Education in 1954, the Civil Rights Acts of 1957 and 1964, and the Voting Rights Act of 1965.</li> <li>3. Explain contributions of individuals and groups to the modern Civil Rights Movement, including: Martin Luther King, Jr., James Meredith, Medgar Evers,</li> </ol>

Standard	Objectives
	<p>Thurgood Marshall, <u>Rosa Parks</u>, <u>Fannie Lou Hamer</u>, the Southern Christian Leadership Conference (SCLC), the Student Nonviolent Coordinating Committee (SNCC), the Congress of Racial Equality (CORE), the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP), <u>the grassroots efforts of the Civil Rights movement</u> <del>(and</del> the civil rights foot soldiers).</p> <p>4. Describe the development of a Black Power movement, including: the change in focus of the SNCC, the rise of Malcolm X, <del>and</del> Stokely Carmichael, and the Black Panther movement.</p> <p>5. Describe the significance of Martin Luther King, Jr.'s "Letter from a Birmingham Jail" and his "I Have a Dream" speech.</p> <p>6. Describe the accomplishments of the modern civil rights movement, including: the growth of the African American middle class, increased political power, and declining rates of African American poverty.</p> <p>7. <u>Evaluate the effectiveness of major non-violent demonstrations and events on the Civil Rights Movement including Montgomery Bus Boycott, sit-ins, Freedom Rides, the March on Washington, and Selma March.</u></p>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The content strand information has been deleted. As we say in our introduction, the only critique we have of this standard is its placement, which comes out of sequence in the course.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting and Content

The most substantive content change to the objectives for this standard is the addition of USH.11.7, which specifically references "non-violent demonstrations." USH.11.3 has also been revised to include specific references to Rosa Parks, Fannie Lou Hamer, and grassroots elements of the Civil Rights movement. These are all substantive and welcome additions. Other formatting changes are not substantive.

## STANDARD USH.12

Standard	Objectives
<p>1992 to Present</p> <p>Explain key domestic issues as well as America's role in the changing world from 1992 to present. <del>(Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, Geography, History, Economics)</del></p>	<p>1. Examine the <del>C</del>contract with America, Impeachment Trial of William "Bill" Clinton, Eminent Domain issues, No Child Left Behind, Hurricane Katrina, and Affordable Care Act of 2010.</p> <p>2. Describe <u>the reactions to</u> global trade agreements, terrorist attack of September 11, 2001, Operation Iraqi Freedom, and the War in Afghanistan, and the PATRIOT<del>at</del>riot Act, global <u>and domestic</u> terrorism, TSA, NAFTA, Homeland Security global climate concerns, immigration, national debt, and technological trends.</p> <p>3. Discuss the Presidential Elections of 2000, 2008, and 2016. <del>Election and 2008 and Barack Obama as the first African-American President and the unconventional Election of 2016 and the advent of Donald Trump.</del></p> <p>4. <del>Describe global trade agreements, Contract with America, impeachment trial of William "Bill" Clinton, terrorist attack of September 11, 2001, Operation Iraqi Freedom, war in Afghanistan, Patriot Act, election of the first African-American President Barack Obama, Affordable Care Act of 2010, domestic and global terrorism, global climate concerns, immigration, election of Donald Trump, national debt and technological trends.</del></p>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The content strand information has been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting and Content

Changes to the objectives for this standard include some substantial streamlining of required material. In USH.12.3, references to the historic nature of the 2008 and 2016 elections have been removed. USH.12.4 has been removed entirely. Much of the specific content named in the previous versions of USH.12.3 and USH.12.4 has either been added to USH.12.2 (e.g., the PATRIOT Act) or is already included in USH.12.1 or USH.12.2 (e.g., Bill Clinton’s impeachment). The intent of these revisions appears to be to streamline the objectives without sacrificing content.

It is very hard to write standards for recent history as we do not always have the necessary perspective to see what is most important, but these objectives lack mention of major events following 2008, with the exception of the passage of the Affordable Care Act in 2010. A few additional objectives seem warranted.

## U.S. GOVERNMENT

### Purpose of Course

This course is typically taught to high school seniors and is a half-credit course. It is the only required course primarily focused on national government and civics in the entire social studies framework. By the end of the course, students are expected to understand the structure and workings of the federalist system of American government, the philosophical ideas and principles that led to its creation, and the rights and responsibilities afforded citizens. Some of the content overlaps with the fifth and eighth grade American history courses, but this course provides more depth on the workings of government. Please note that by the time most students are high school seniors, they will not have learned any related information in almost four years.

There are eight standards in this course with each named as “USG” (for U.S. Government) followed by a number. When referring to a particular standard, we list it by its official name: USG.1, for example. Objectives are referred to by the standard name with an added number for the objective: USG.1.1. At times, the 2021 standards or objectives have moved since the 2018 revision. In these cases, we specify whether the standard or objective refers to the 2021 or 2018 version.

### Overall Evaluation of Course and Recommendation

This course is the second strongest related to American history and government that Mississippi students take, only bested by the U.S. history course typically taken in the eleventh grade. While it does contain a lot of important content especially for a half-credit course, several deletions weaken the depth of the course by either leaving content decisions to curriculum or omitting important topics entirely. **We recommend that the course be revised to re-introduce more detail and the omitted topics.**

Finally, **none of the changes in this revision serve to introduce “critical race theory” into the U.S. Government course. Critical race theory is also not required by any standard or objective in this course.** The 2021 revisions also remove any relation to “action civics.”

### Summary of Formatting Changes

Like the other course revisions, the U.S. Government standards revision deletes the list of content strands covered by each standard. Since most standards in this course cover multiple content strands, the information was not useful. One standard from 2018 has also been separated into two standards and the relevant objectives moved to the new standard. This led to a renumbering of the latter half of the standards. There are also a few places where objectives have been re-ordered within their standard or have been broken into multiple objectives.

### Summary of Clarification and Content Changes

In general, the changes to the standards and objectives in this course clarify what the standard or objective means or what students should be able to do with information. One consistent change is that the word “debate” has been replaced with another verb every place it appeared in the 2018 version. There are also several revisions which remove specific examples, leaving it up to a school’s curriculum to determine which examples may be used to teach the objective and what emphasis to place on those examples. This is generally a negative change.

There were a handful of major content changes to the course introduced in this revision. All of these important changes are deletions. The following topics have been removed entirely from the course:

- The history of the U.S. Supreme Court slowly applying civil liberties and civil rights to the states beginning in the period following the Civil War
- The origin, development, and role of American political parties
- The history of the nomination process for presidential candidates and the increasing importance of primaries
- The role of polls and campaign advertising in elections

It is unclear if two other topics have also been entirely removed as the result of deletions:

- Modern philosophies of the role of government represented in the American context
- How conflicts between levels of American government are resolved in our federal system

With the exception of some content on the origin of the first American political parties in eighth grade history, none of these topics are covered within the other American history courses that students in Mississippi are required to take. We believe the deletion of most of these topics weakens the course.

Another major substantive change to note is that the only objective—2018 USG.7.4—that could be termed “action civics” has been deleted in the 2021 version. This former objective asked students to “develop and practice a course of action to address local and/or state issues.” Students are no longer required by the state standards to take any civic action. This should lay to rest any objections to the standards arising from a disagreement with “action civics” as an approach to instruction.

### In-Depth Analysis

#### STANDARD USG.1

Standard	Objectives
<del>Compare and contrast knowledge and application of</del> <u>Examine</u> the basic concepts of democracy. ( <del>Strands: Civics,</del> <del>Civil Rights, History, Economics</del> )	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Evaluate the fundamental worth and dignity of the individual.</li> <li>2. Examine the equality of all citizens under the law.</li> <li>3. Compare and contrast majority rule and minority rights.</li> <li>4. <del>Debate</del> <u>Evaluate</u> the necessity of compromise.</li> <li>5. <del>Contrast the meaning of the</del> <u>Define</u> freedom of the individual.</li> <li>6. Compare and contrast the difference between private and civic life.</li> <li>7. <u>Evaluate</u> <u>Analyze</u> the relationship between politics and government.</li> </ol>

#### ✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting and Clarification

The change to this standard from “compare and contrast” to “examine” makes the standard less confusing. Compare and contrast implies looking for similarities and differences when that might not be applicable. “Examine” could include comparing and contrasting as well as other types of analysis, so it is a clearer choice in this instance. The content strand information has also been deleted.

#### ✓ Changes to Objectives: Clarification

The changes to objectives adjust what students should be able to do with the information: “evaluate” instead of “debate” and “analyze the relationship” instead of “evaluate the relationship.” Objective 5, which was not at all clear as originally written, now makes more sense.

**STANDARD USG.2**

Standard	Objectives
<p>Evaluate the foundational American political principles and the historical events, documents and philosophical ideas that shaped the formation of the United States. <i>(Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, History, Economics)</i></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Trace the development of Athenian democracy and the Roman republic.</li> <li>Compare and contrast <del>the influence of</del> the Magna Carta, the English Petition of Right, and the English Bill of Rights <u>and their significance on the foundational documents of the United States.</u></li> <li><del>Compare</del> <u>Examine</u> the writings of Hobbes, Locke, and Montesquieu.</li> <li>Describe the guarantee of the “rights of Englishmen” that had been violated by the British government through statutory regulation.</li> <li><del>6.</del> Evaluate the Articles of Confederation as a ruling document. <i>(formerly 6)</i></li> <li><del>5.</del> Analyze the natural rights philosophies expressed in the Declaration of Independence. <i>(formerly 5)</i></li> <li>Examine the importance of Shay’s Rebellion in the formation of the Constitution.</li> <li>Compare <u>and contrast</u> the backgrounds of the Founding Fathers at the Constitutional Convention.</li> <li><del>Debate</del> <u>Analyze</u> how the U.S. Constitution <del>reflects a balance between</del> <u>balances</u> the classical republican concern <u>with</u> <del>of</del> promotion of the public good and the classical liberal concern <u>with</u> <del>of</del> protecting individual rights. <del>and discuss how the basic premises of liberal constitutionalism and democracy are joined in the Declaration of Independence as “self-evident truths.”</del> <i>(deletion moved to new objective)</i></li> <li><u>Discuss</u> how liberal constitutionalism and democracy are joined in the Declaration of Independence as “self-evident truths.”</li> <li><del>10.</del> <del>Trace</del> <u>Describe</u> how the Founding Fathers’ realistic view of human nature led directly to the establishment of a constitutional system that limited the power of the governors and the governed as articulated in the Federalist Papers.</li> <li><del>11.</del> <del>Investigate the systems of separated and shared powers, the role of organized interests (Federalist Paper Number 10), checks and balances (Federalist Paper Number 51), the importance of an independent judiciary (Federalist Paper Number 78), enumerated powers, rule of law, federalism, and civilian control of the military. (deleted entirely)</del></li> <li><del>Contrast that</del> <u>Analyze</u> the creation of the Bill of Rights <del>limits</del> and the powers it gives to <del>of the federal government and state governments</del> <u>state governments and the Federal government.</u></li> <li><del>13.</del> <del>Critique James Madison’s leadership role in securing adoption of the Bill of Rights by the First Congress and its evolution from that time. (deleted entirely)</del></li> <li><del>14.</del> <del>Debate</del> <u>Assess</u> how <del>the</del> different philosophies and <del>power</del> structures <del>of feudalism, mercantilism, socialism, fascism, communism, monarchies, parliamentary systems, and constitutional liberal democracies influence</del> determine economic policies, social welfare policies, and human rights practices.</li> <li><del>15.</del> Compare <del>the various ways in which</del> <u>how</u> power is distributed, shared, and limited in <del>systems of shared powers and in</del> parliamentary systems.</li> <li><del>16.</del> Compare <del>the advantages and disadvantages of</del> federal, confederal, and unitary systems of government <u>to determine the advantages and disadvantages of each.</u></li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

The content strand information has been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification, and Content

There are several changes to the objectives for this standard. Some changes adjust what students should be able to do with particular information: “examine” instead of “compare” or “analyze” instead of “debate.” Some rewordings simply make the objective clearer, such as changes to USG.2.2, USG.2.11, and USG.2.16. A few objectives get formatting changes—2021



USG.2.5 and USG.2.6 have been reversed in order from the 2018 version—while 2018 USG.2.9 is now split into two objectives, 2021 USG.2.9 and USG.2.10. The effect of this set of revisions is small, but it does improve their understandability.

There are three content changes to make note of. First, USG.2.11 and USG.2.13 from the 2018 version are deleted entirely. USG.2.11 listed specific concepts described in the Federalist papers, sometimes with reference to a particular paper. USG.2.13 centered James Madison’s role in the Bill of Rights. These changes may have been made to streamline the objectives as 2018 USG.2.11 and .13 overlap content in the preceding objectives, which remain in the 2021 version. Similarly, 2021 USG.2.13 deletes specific governmental philosophies and structures listed in the objective as examples. The effect of these revisions is that the curricula choices made by schools will determine whether these specific examples or objectives are emphasized in instruction. Re-adding the list from 2018’s USG.2.11 to 2021’s USG.2.11 would strengthen the objective.

### STANDARD USG.3

Standard	Objectives
<del>Differentiate</del> <u>Evaluate</u> the basic organization <del>of the US government and explain and the function of each branch of the US of the</del> United States government. (Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, History, Economics)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><del>1. Differentiate</del> <u>Examine</u> the functions <del>and relationships of the legislative, executive, and judicial branches among the three branches of government.</del></li> <li><del>2. Analyze the relationships among the three branches in a system of checks and balances. (merged into USG.3.1)</del></li> <li><del>3. Investigate different perspectives on the role of government. (deleted entirely)</del></li> <li><del>4. Examine how the national government influences the public agenda and shapes public policy, including the setting of the public agenda and implementation of it through regulations and executive orders. (moved to USG.4.1, with edits)</del></li> <li><del>5. Debate how public policy is formed: compare the processes of lawmaking at each of the three levels of government, including the role of lobbying and the media. (moved to USG.4.2-3, with edits)</del></li> <li><del>6. Identify the organization and jurisdiction of federal, state, and local courts and the their interrelationships among them.</del></li> <li><del>7. Assess the scope of presidential power and decision making through examination of legislation and military action. case studies such as the Cuban Missile Crisis, passage of Great Society legislation, War Powers Act, Gulf War, and Bosnia.</del></li> <li><del>8. Trace the process by which policy is implemented by the bureaucracy at each level. (merged into USG.4.2, with edits)</del></li> <li><del>9. Contrast the organization, jurisdiction, and proceedings of federal courts.</del></li> <li><del>10. Evaluate how John Marshall established the Supreme Court as an independent, co-equal branch of government through his opinion in Marbury v. Madison.</del></li> <li><del>11. Analyze how the Supreme Court decides cases by comparing</del> <u>Compare</u> the philosophies of judicial activism and judicial restraint <u>and explain their role in Supreme Court decision making.</u></li> <li><del>12. Evaluate how the judiciary influences public policy by delineating the power of government and safeguarding the rights of the individual.</del></li> </ol>

#### ✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting and Clarification

The new standard is re-worded to make it clearer and simpler. Details are left to the objectives. The content strand information has also been deleted.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification, and Content

There are several edits to the objectives for this standard, but in general, the revisions re-focus the objectives on the powers of each branch of government while all of the content about the process of policy creation and implementation moves to new USG.4. Some of the re-wordings also make the objectives clearer to the reader or delete unnecessary words.

There are two changes to these objectives that we believe are substantive. First, 2018 USG.3.3, which asked students to understand different “perspectives” (read: philosophies) about the role of government, was deleted entirely. This change better aligns the objectives to the standard because understanding philosophies of government moves beyond the scope of the both the new and old USG.3, which are both focused on understanding the “basic organization and function” of the government. However, all content related to philosophies of governance solely appears in USG.1, and while some of the objectives are certainly related, it is unclear if modern philosophies of the role of government will adequately be covered by USG.1.

The other substantive change is that the examples have been deleted from 2021 USG.3.3 (2018 USG.3.7). As with the deletion of examples in USG.2, the effect of this revision is that the curriculum choices made by schools will determine whether these specific examples are emphasized in instruction. A list here would be helpful.

**STANDARD USG.4**

Standard	Objectives
<u>Analyze the creation and implementation of public policy in the United States.</u>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <u>Examine how the national government influences the public agenda and shapes public policy.</u> (formerly USG.3.4, with edits)</li> <li>2. <u>Describe the process by which public policy is formed and implemented by the national, state, and local government.</u> (formerly USG.3.5 and USG.3.8, with edits)</li> <li>3. <u>Compare the processes of lawmaking by national, state, and local governments.</u> (formerly USG.3.5, with edits)</li> <li>4. <u>Analyze how individuals, interest groups, lobbyists, and the media influence public policy.</u> (formerly USG.7.2 with the addition of lobbyists from USG.3.5)</li> <li>5. <u>Evaluate how the judiciary influences public policy by delineating the power of government and safeguarding the rights of the individual.</u> (formerly USG.3.12)</li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

As explained above, this is a new standard created by separating some of the content from 2018 USG.3 into its own standard. It does not substantively introduce new content into the course.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting

All of the objectives for this standard are drawn from 2018 USG.3 and 2018 USG.7.2, as follows:

- 2018 USG.3.4 was moved to become 2021 USG.4.1 with the final clause omitted.
- 2018 USG.3.5 was broken into two objectives—2021 USG.4.2-3—and edited slightly.
- 2018 USG.7.2 was moved to become 2021 USG.4.4 with the addition of lobbyists from 2018, USG.3.5.
- 2018 USG.3.12 was moved to become 2021 USG.4.5.

As a whole, these objectives, though reorganized and edited slightly, retain their essential character, so we have classified these changes as formatting.

**STANDARD USG.5**

Standard	Objectives
<p><del>USG.4</del> Analyze of [sic] the role of federalism in addressing the distribution of power between the national, state, and local governments. (<i>Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, History, Economics</i>)</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Explain the relationship <del>of the</del> <u>and powers shared between</u> state governments and the national government.</li> <li>2. Trace the extent to which power is shared <u>by all levels of government</u>.</li> <li>3. <del>Identify</del> <u>Examine</u> the powers denied <del>to</del> state governments and national government.</li> <li>4. Evaluate <del>the ongoing debate that focuses on</del> the balance of power between state <u>governments</u> and national governments, <del>especially in terms of</del> <u>related to</u> funding.</li> <li>5. Investigate how the amendment process protects both the national <u>government</u> and state governments.</li> <li><del>6. Explain how conflicts between levels of government and branches of government are resolved.</del></li> <li>6. <del>Compare</del> <u>Identify</u> the major responsibilities and sources of revenue for state and local governments.</li> <li><del>7. Contrast reserved powers and concurrent powers of state governments.</del></li> <li>7. <del>Compare and contrast the Ninth and Tenth Amendments and</del> <u>Analyze the various interpretations and</u> <del>of the</del> extent of the federal government's power <u>provided by the Ninth and Tenth Amendments</u>.</li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

Because of the new USG.4, this standard has now become USG.5. The content strand information has also been deleted. These are simple formatting changes.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Clarification and Content

There are several word edits that serve to clarify the meaning of objectives or removes unnecessary words. One objective which overlapped with several others—2018 USG.4.7—has also been deleted, which streamlines the list. Another deleted objective—2018 USG.4.6—was partially outside the scope of the standard, as a part of the objective referred to conflicts between branches of government which is more related to USG.3. We consider all of these revisions clarifications.

There is one content change. Part of the deleted USG.4.6 referred to how conflicts between levels of government are resolved. This idea overlaps with content covered by several other objectives, but it is not explicit in other objectives. This is an area where a deletion may have removed important content from the course depending on the interpretation of the other objectives by school districts. We suggest the state re-introduce examples.

**STANDARD USG.6**

Standard	Objectives
<p><del>USG.5</del> <del>Compare and contrast</del> <u>Differentiate</u> civil rights from civil liberties and <del>explain</del> describe how each have been interpreted and amended throughout <u>American United States'</u> history. (<i>Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, History, Economics</i>)</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <del>Investigate</del> <u>Examine the civil liberties and rights guaranteed in the Bill of Rights, with emphasis on First Amendment freedoms.</u></li> <li>2. <del>Analyze the concept of</del> <u>Explain</u> due process of law as expressed in the Fifth and Fourteenth Amendments.</li> <li><del>3. Trace selective incorporation of the Bill of Rights.</del></li> <li>3. <del>4.</del> Evaluate the balance between individual liberties and the public <del>interest of</del> order.</li> <li><del>5. Assess the statement "It is every citizen's right to be treated equally under the law."</del></li> </ol>

Standard	Objectives
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. <del>6. Trace the</del> <u>Analyze</u> changing interpretations of the Bill of Rights over time, including interpretations of the basic freedoms, including: religion, speech, press, petition, and assembly, articulated in the particularly the First Amendment and equal protection of the law clauses of the Fourteenth Amendments.</li> <li>5. <del>7.</del> Analyze judicial activism and restraint as well as the effects of each policy over the decades, including: the Warren and Rehnquist courts.</li> <li>6. <del>8.</del> Evaluate the effects of the Court's interpretations of the Constitution in <i>Marbury v. Madison</i> (1803), <i>McCulloch v. Maryland</i> (1819), and <i>United States v. Nixon</i> (1974) with emphasis on the arguments espoused in each side in these cases.</li> <li>7. <del>9.</del> Investigate the controversies that have resulted over changing interpretations of civil rights, including: <i>Plessy v. Ferguson</i>, <i>Brown v. Board of Education</i>, <i>Miranda v. Arizona</i>, <i>Regents of the University of California v. Bakke</i>, <i>Adarand Constructors, Inc. v. Peña</i>, and <i>United States v. Virginia</i> (VMI).</li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting and Clarification

Because of the new USG.4, this standard has now become USG.6. The content strand information has also been deleted. These are simple formatting changes. The standard has also been edited slightly. "Compare and contrast" has been changed to "differentiate." Though small, this change makes it more clear that these concepts should be taught as related but different, rather than opposing. The changes from "explain" to "describe" and "American" to "United States" are similarly small.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification, and Content

In terms of formatting and clarifications, there are a few word changes to these objectives (e.g., "investigate" is now "examine," etc.) and some objectives have been re-numbered due to deletions.

There are two types of content changes to note. Several objectives have had examples or other details or explanatory text removed (USG.6.1 and USG.6.4-7), and 2018 USG.5.5, which was a very specific objective that overlapped with several others, has been deleted. The effect of these revisions is that the choice of examples and the emphasis given them will depend on the curriculum chosen by local school districts. The most important content change, though, is the deletion of 2018 USG.5.3: "Trace selective incorporation of the Bill of Rights." This objective pertains to the history of the U.S. Supreme Court slowly applying federal rights to the states in the period following the Civil War and into the 20th century. While this concept may be related to other objectives, it is not specifically covered anywhere else in this course nor is it covered in either U.S. History course. We believe it should not have been omitted.

## STANDARD USG.7

Standard	Objectives
USG.6 Describe the role and function of linkage institutions such as the media, interest groups, political parties, and political action committees, on the [sic] citizens and federal government. (Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, History, Economics)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><del>1. Compare and contrast the role and function of the media, interest groups, political parties, political action committees in a democracy.</del></li> <li><del>2. Analyze the origin, development, and role of political parties, noting those occasional periods in which there was only one major party or were more than two major parties.</del></li> <li><del>3. Trace the history of the nomination process for presidential candidates and the increasing importance of primaries in general elections.</del></li> <li>1. <del>4. Evaluate the roles of polls, campaign advertising, and the</del> <u>Describe</u> the controversies over campaign funding.</li> </ol>

Standard	Objectives
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><del>10.</del> Evaluate the decision <i>Citizens United v. Federal Election Commission</i> (2010) on campaign financing. (formerly GS6.10)</li> <li>Examine how linkage groups impact primary and general elections; <del>and as well as</del> citizen involvement in campaigns.</li> <li>Identify major interest groups, <del>including: AARP, NRA, ACLU, American Bar Association, American Medical Association, National Chamber of Commerce, and Sierra Club, in terms of</del> and their major agenda messages.</li> <li>Evaluate the responsibility of citizens to thoughtfully <del>evaluate evidence</del> examine information presented by media and interest groups in <del>order to form</del> forming <del>their</del> individual political opinions.</li> <li><del>Evaluate</del> Identify the role of journalism <del>including internet vs. traditional media</del> <del>on</del> in the political process <del>and trace its development over time.</del></li> <li><del>Debate the history and</del> Examine the role and history of Political Action Committees and interest groups on the electoral process.</li> </ol>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

Because of the new USG.4, this standard has now become USG.7. The content strand information has also been deleted. These are simple formatting changes.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification, and Content

There are a few formatting and clarification changes of note. First, 2018 USG.6.1 has been deleted. We consider this simply a clarification as this objective was nearly identical to the actual standard. There are also some word edits, such as amending “debate” in favor of “examine” (USG.7.7) and changing “examine” to “identify” (USG.7.6). In the latter case, “identify” requires less critical thinking as students are not asked to judge the role of journalism, merely be aware of it. “Evaluate evidence” has also become “examine information” (USG.7.5). One objective has also been moved up in the order.

In addition to these formatting changes and clarifications, there are also extensive content changes to these objectives. In keeping with other changes throughout the document, USG.7.4 has had its examples removed and USG.7.6 has become less specific as to types of journalists. The effect of these revision is that the choice of examples will depend on the curriculum chosen by local school districts. More importantly, these objectives have the most changes in regards to content being removed from the course. Notably, the deletions in this revision remove a few important concepts:

- The origin, development, and role of political parties
- The history of the nomination process for presidential candidates and the increasing importance of primaries
- The role of polls and campaign advertising

These concepts are not found specifically or substantively elsewhere in the course. The origin of the first American political parties is covered in eighth grade history, but their development and role as well as the rest of this list is not found in either U.S. History course. This is a major substantive change of the 2021 revision and one we think is negative.

## STANDARD USG.8

Standard	Objectives
USG.7-Describe and evaluate the role, rights, and responsibility of a citizen in the American democracy. (Strands: Civics, Civil Rights, History, Economics)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Evaluate the effectiveness of citizen efforts to influence decisions of state and local governments by examining <del>historical or contemporary</del> events.</li> </ol>

Standard	Objectives
	<p><del>2. Analyze how individuals, interest groups, and the media influence public policy: (moved to USG.4.4)</del></p> <p>3. Compare the <del>means</del> ways that citizens <del>use</del> to participate in the political process, <del>including</del>: voting, campaigning, lobbying, filing a legal challenge, demonstrating, petitioning, picketing, and running for political office.</p> <p><del>4. Develop and practice a course of action to address local and/or state issues.</del></p> <p>4. <del>5. Analyze trends in voter turnout, the causes and effects of reapportionment and redistricting, with special attention to spatial districting and the rights of minorities, and the function of the Electoral College. (clauses separated into new objectives USG.8.5-6)</del></p> <p>5. Investigate the causes and effects of reapportionment and redistricting, including spatial districting and the rights of minorities. (from 2018 USG.7.5)</p> <p>6. Examine the function of the Electoral College. (from 2018 USG.7.5)</p> <p>7. <del>6. Contrast the meaning and</del> Identify the importance of each of the rights guaranteed <del>under</del> by the Bill of Rights and how each is secured, <del>including</del>: specifically freedom of religion, speech, press, assembly, petition, privacy.</p> <p>8. <del>7. Debate how</del> Identify the importance of economic rights <del>and explain how they are secured and their importance to the individual and to society, including: the right to acquire, use, transfer, and dispose of property, the right to choose one's work, the right to join or not join labor unions, copyright and patent.</del></p> <p>9. <del>8. Discuss the individual's</del> legal obligations to obey the law, serve as a juror, and pay taxes.</p> <p>10. <del>9. Trace</del> Justify the obligations of civic mindedness, <del>including</del>: voting, being informed on civic issues, volunteering, <del>and</del> performing public service, and serving in the military or alternative service.</p> <p>11. <del>10. Describe the</del> Explain reciprocity between rights and obligations, <del>that is, why enjoyment of one's rights entails respect for the rights of others.</del></p> <p>12. <del>11. Explain</del> Describe how one becomes a citizen of the United States, <del>including the process of naturalization, including: literacy, language, and other requirements.</del></p>

✓ Changes to the Standard: Formatting

Because of the new USG.4, this standard has now become USG.8. The content strand information has also been deleted. These are simple formatting changes.

✓ Changes to Objectives: Formatting, Clarification, and Content

There are a few minor word edits (e.g., “means” becomes “ways,” “including” becomes “specifically”) or the removal of unnecessary words (e.g., “historical or contemporary” as that would be all inclusive). The word “debate” becomes “identify,” which clarifies what students should be able to do. “Contrast” also becomes “identify,” which helps the objective make more sense as rights do not necessarily stand in contrast with one another.

The 2021 revision includes some formatting changes as well. One of the 2018 objectives (2018 USG.7.5) is broken into three separate 2021 objectives (USG.8.4-6), which increases the readability of the objectives. Furthermore, the former USG.7.2 is moved to 2021 USG.4.4. This change ensures all of the objectives are now focused on the individual’s role, rights, and responsibility in American democracy, as the standard says, rather than the individual’s (or other groups’) role in the process of policymaking. We consider this a formatting change since content has not been deleted from the course.

There are two content changes of note. First, details or explanatory text have been removed from 2021 USG.8.8, 11, and 12 (2018 USG.7.7, 10, 11). Like all other instances of details being removed, the effect of these revisions is that the curricula choices made by schools will determine whether and how these specific examples are emphasized in instruction. Finally, the only objective—2018 USG.7.4—that could be termed “action civics” has been deleted in the 2021 version. Students are no longer required by the state standards to take any civic action. This is a major substantive content change, perhaps the largest in the entire 2021 revision for U.S. Government.